

Dennis Murray called the meeting to order at 5 p.m. after the Invocation, given by Dave Waddington, and the Pledge of Allegiance.

The clerk called the roll and the following Commissioners responded: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole.

**City staff present:** Dave Degnan - Fire Chief, Aaron Klein – Public Works Director, Matt Lasko – Chief Development Officer, Angela Byington – Director of Planning, Brad Link – Public Service Director, Don Rumbutis – IT, Stuart Hamilton – IT Manager, Justin Harris - Law Director, Hank Solowiej – Finance Director, Eric Wobser – City Manager, Kelly Kresser – Commission Clerk.

**Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve the minutes of the January 9, 2017, meeting and dispense with the formal reading. The President declared the motion passed.**

### **PRESENTATION**

Pete Schade, Erie County Health Department (ECHD), said he wishes to go through some new programs and items which Sandusky citizens may wish to be made aware of regarding the Board of Health. The ECHD is an agency under the Erie County Commissioners and represents nine townships, five villages and three principle cities including the City of Vermilion which goes into Lorain County. The Board of Health has eleven members, five of whom are appointed by the City of Sandusky. Recently, the ECHD received its public health accreditation and is the 35<sup>th</sup> Health Department out of 3,500 in the nation to achieve this. The ECHD's mission is about disease prevention. The ECHD is a co-applicant of the Erie County Community Health Center which is funded by Health Resource & Services Administration in Washington and which provides primary care, oral care, behavioral health care and other services. The Health Center is fully funded and approximately \$650,000 is provided annually from the federal government to pay for the clinicians. The Health Center Board of Directors also has eleven members and meets once each month for the day-to-day governance on how to provide care for our community. A big part of the ECHD is epidemiology (study of disease) and there currently is a flu epidemic on the uptake in the community. They also work with bio-terrorism preparedness and monitor visits to the emergency room and what people are being treated for. Over-the-counter pharmaceutical sales are monitored to assist with tracking disease. The 2017 budget is up almost \$12 million from last year and the opioid epidemic has created the need for a medically-supervised detoxification facility and inpatient rehabilitation center. There is a 1 mill total levy which costs \$26.87 per year on a home valued at \$100,000 to support the ECHD. This is eighteen percent of the total budget. Other funding has come from grants and other revenue streams totaling approximately \$3.2 million for this year. Public health assessments are done on a cyclical basis to obtain data to show what we need to do for the community. This is how the ECHD realized there were a large number of people without dental insurance in the County and developed policy to put together a dental clinic. The third core function of the ECHD is to assure the citizens and leaders they are doing what they should as an agency. There are approximately 100 persons working at the ECHD. There is a Construction Division which performs plumbing inspections around Erie County, a Lead Paint Division and Environmental Health Division. One of the biggest programs is Women, Infant & Children (WIC) which sees about 2,900 moms and kids each month. There is also a WIC office in Norwalk which is served by the ECHD and the Vermilion office sees folks from across Lorain County. This is a nutritional, supplemental, education program for mothers to make sure children are developing appropriately for their age. The Administrative office does financial planning, vital statistics, strategic planning and performance management. One of the most recently completed projects is a regional response water lab to test well and city water, test for algal blooms and other recreational water sources. The ECHD just received a new HUD lead grant and there are a lot of issues with lead-based paint in the community. This grant will allow the ECHD to work with people to remediate lead-based hazards in homes using specific criteria (\$3 million over three years). There is one specific neighborhood in Sandusky with child lead poisoning potential going through the roof. Kids are entering rental units and becoming lead sick and this is unacceptable for anyone to put up with. One child was taken in for lead poisoning and then transported to Akron Children's Hospital where his blood level was 101; action is usually taken

at a level of 5 and there was no landlord education or prevention. Another four-year old child living in a rental unit had elevated blood levels as well as his sibling's and these are problems we need to work on together. This is a known toxin which is poisoning our kids and once poisoned, their quality of life is diminished forever. Behavioral health services are a big part of the ECHD's future and a rendering of the new center was shown. Detoxification is an important first step and then getting patients into inpatient treatment. Pete Schade said he would one day like to take the whole Health Department Campus and turn it into a County Hospital for psychiatric care, behavioral health care and other care, and have a more efficient building for the Health Department. Dave Waddington said lead paint has been a big problem in homes but asked about lead pipes and drinking water; Pete Schade said the lead they are worried about is in children five and under and there are a lot of lead pipes but there are replacement parts for indoor plumbing to help remediate lead from water. The ECHD's focus is on lead dust created from walking across a floor or opening a window. It is important to run water before drinking and is not a big focal point of lead poisoning. Naomi Twine said she has a particular interest in working with the Health Department about this issue. Wes Poole asked why the State is not providing money for lead abatement testing if it is such a large problem and to provide notice about lead to persons in specific homes. Pete Schade said there has been legislation in the past but this has changed and never came to fruition for a residential setting. There is no across-the-board legislative effort, it is up to the local departments to tackle. Wes Poole asked if writing to Congressmen or State Representatives would help before the kids are damaged as then it is too late. Nikki Lloyd asked how easy it is to test for lead and Pete Schade said there are a lot of different components, but it is very easy. There are dust wipes, visual inspections and equipment used to determine lead levels. Nikki Lloyd said the city passed rental registration requirements last year and asked if these internal inspections can be added to find lead early. Pete Schade said it makes sense for those renting not to have the liability for making a kid sick and it does not cost money to remediate this threat. Dick Brady said through Mr. Schade's leadership, the ECHD now serves a new opportunity with behavioral health and asked how a disproportionate share is not applied toward this. Pete Schade said the ECHD follows a strategic plan and follows data gathered from the health assessments to figure out where they are going with a lot of these issues. Wes Poole asked what the cost is per lead test and Pete Schade said it is about \$8 each. Dennis Murray thanked Pete Schade and the ECHD Board for the leadership they are providing and for the hard work they do; the city is very fortunate to have an engaged Health Department in Erie County.

#### **AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION**

Tim Schwanger, representing Save Our Shoreline Parks, 362 Sheffield Way, said the Jackson Street Pier redesign (Item #7) is a conceptual drawing, but it is the same as the one presented five months ago and hoped there would be more consideration toward the general public, the elderly and handicapped to preserve some of the parking spaces along the water's edge. In the new rendition, it looks as if the parking has moved out a little bit, but not significantly. In the five-year budget, \$2.6 million has been budgeted for this project, but hopes it can be scaled back. Tim Schwanger asked how many amphitheaters we need in the city and said we should do what is right for the general public, not what is right for a bar or a hotel. With regard to the former Hopper's trailer park and Sunoco Station (Item #2), Tim Schwanger said he has done research on NRP Properties and it appears they came to the city in 2006 to build 50 owner-occupied homes. Rather than going with a proposal for senior rental housing, Tim Schwanger said we should look to NRP for a home ownership development in this area similar to the Snow Court development. He does not recall an RFP for this property and said the west side residents have asked for an anchor project (retail or commercial) and we do not need additional senior rental housing.

Sue Daugherty, Serving Our Seniors (SOS) Director, said she is in favor of the sale of property for additional senior housing (Item #7). SOS has been advocating the construction of more affordable rental housing for older adults as this is a need in Erie County. Hopefully Sandusky can be a trendsetter for many of the older adults who thought they would be retiring with benefits but have found they will not get them. There are more divorces in older life and when couples break up near or in retirement, the preparedness they thought they would have at retirement is no longer the case and predominantly this affects older women. There is a very

clear need for affordable housing for older adults although we have not been able to substantiate this with a study; even more-so for individuals who will not qualify for rental adjustment for income. This means there are more retirees who will not be able to keep their home because of too much debt. SOS is a strong proponent of market-rate and more affordable rentals for seniors and looks forward to this development being brought to our market.

Barbara Linden, Muirwood Village resident, asked the commissioners to consider the senior citizens and handicapped persons of Sandusky regarding the Jackson Street Pier. This is the only dock when they can fish, and/or people to eat lunch in their cars. Barbara Linden asked where they would go if they cannot drive onto the Pier.

Nancy Beach, 401 West Shoreline Drive, said the Jackson Street Pier is her front yard as she lives in the Chesapeake building. There were fifteen cars on the Pier when she left tonight with people looking at the water and there are elderly persons who sit and eat ice cream or look at the water. Nancy Beach said she loves the rendering and said this would be beautiful to see, but thinks we can compromise on this and still have a drivable experience. The whole outer point of the pier has enough space to keep a couple lanes of traffic. The rendering shows a great summertime, spring and fall experience, but in the winter, there are still vehicles using the Pier.

Nick Pasqualini, 527 Gartland Avenue, said there was a recent meeting where he heard Dennis Murray say people who come from out of town to the Pier do not spend money while on their boats or going to the islands, and asked if there has ever been a survey taken to see how many people stay overnight or eat in Sandusky and the surrounding areas. If the Jackson Street Pier is planted up fully with trees, the city would not get any money from them either and asked to redesign this concept and think of the local people.

Chris Parthemore, 111 East Madison Street, said he used to live in Chesapeake Lofts and there were always ten to fifteen cars utilizing the end of the Pier, but argued this is underutilizing this space. The rest of the Pier always sits empty and is vast asphalt. He recently visited Chicago and went for a run along the lakefront and it struck him there was no parking along the waterfront or on the piers. This waterfront was utilized by people of all ages to fish and run and it was a vibrant area. Last year, he went to Duluth, Minnesota to see how they utilize their waterfront and there is not waterfront parking in this space; rather it is utilized by people of all ages with bike trails, ice skating rinks or parks, amphitheaters and other year-round activities.

Dan Allen, Huron Township Resident (formerly of Sandusky), said the Jackson Street Pier has been a part of his entire life and has always been a place to park. It is great to get a fish sandwich and enjoy the 180 degree view. It is a comforting, reassuring view and it would be a mistake to take away the parking. There can be other things closer to Water Street, Shoreline Drive or Battery Park such as the food sales although he does not like the idea of a building for this purpose. The opportunity should be left for people to park anytime of the year in any type of weather.

Dale Kriss, 1314 Fifth Street, said the Jackson Street Pier concept was brought up a while ago but was tabled and is now back. When downtown, Dale Kriss said he goes to the Pier and meets people there. At the Commission meetings, things are brought up, voted on, and in two weeks, they are passed and people do not have the time to see what is going on and this is totally wrong. People used to be able to drive onto the Battery Park Pier.

Mike Meinzer, 413 Cove Street, said the Jackson Street Pier is too beautiful a piece of property to be wasted for parking (entire pier). People want it to be a public space and a space for the elderly to have lunch and there needs to be a compromise; the city should move through with the engineering tonight and over the next ten months, iron out the details.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said the Jackson Street Pier is a tradition and in the summertime one can hardly find a parking space there. The rendering looks beautiful, but it is not conducive to what we want to do in this area. People who live here year round need to be

taken into consideration. Sharon Johnson said she read there will be vendors on the pier but there are already restaurants. Sharon Johnson asked if the city was going to make another parking lot somewhere else and is concerned with the boating industry here. In the design, there is fencing around the pier but asked how to fish with a fence.

Lauri Kriss, 1334 Fifth Street, said people appreciate the Jackson Street Pier just the way it is and it should be left alone as this is relaxation for them. It is nice to see people gather and talk and should not be taken away for some trees.

Dennis Murray said there will be a period of public comment through this process if the legislation for the Jackson Street Pier passes and this will be happening during the next ten to twelve months. Wes Poole said many of the different comments are based on how people want to utilize the Jackson Street Pier and we will work this out in the end. One of the comments made was inaccurate about parking on the waterfront in Duluth, Minnesota, and said there is a parking lot in Duluth where cars park on the waterfront. We need to be accurate when making comparisons about other places and what is or is not appropriate.

### **PUBLIC HEARING**

**Dennis Murray opened a Public Hearing regarding a Zone Map amendment for properties located at 2513 Venice Road and 1651 Tiffin Avenue.**

Casey Sparks, Assistant Planner, said the city has applied for an amendment to the zone map for these properties which are the former Sunoco Station and the former Hopper's. The zoning at 2513 Venice Road is currently limited manufacturing and general business. The property at 1651 Tiffin Avenue is currently zoned as general business. The application is to rezone both properties as residential and multi-family respectively. Within the past year, the Development Department has received inquiries from developers for potential locations for multi-family development sites within the city. Staff believes this location would be an appropriate location for multi-family development and it has close proximity to local retailers, recreational amenities and transient access. Staff also believes a multi-family development will benefit the general public as it will provide additional housing options on the west side of the city as well as improving a blighted intersection within our city. The city's comprehensive plan recommends this area for industrial redevelopment; the city's Development Department does not believe the properties will be logistically suited for industrial development and there has not been an interest from retail or commercial developers. The proposed amendment does address priorities listed in our Bicentennial Vision Plan to create a vibrant and livable city. These can be accomplished by reclaiming and repurposing blighted sites for redevelopment and by supporting development and rehabilitation for a variety of housing types to meet the needs of our current residents. The Planning Commission unanimously recommended approval of this zoning amendment at the November 30, 2016 meeting and staff recommends the City Commission approve the proposed amendment for both 2513 Venice Road and 1651 Tiffin Avenue.

**The President asked if there were questions or comments regarding this proposed change to the city's zoning code. There being no further comments, the President declared the Public Hearing closed.**

### **CURRENT BUSINESS**

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dick Brady, the Commission voted to accept all communications. The President declared the motion passed.**

**CONSENT AGENDA****A. Submitted by Amanda McClain, Housing Manager****ACCEPTING FIVE PARCELS THROUGH LAND BANK PROGRAM**

**Budgetary Information:** The cost of this acquisition will be approximately \$756 to pay for the title exams and transfer fees. The city will not collect the \$16,081.10 owed to the city in special assessments, nor will the taxing districts collect the \$12,862.20 owed in delinquent taxes. However, all or part of these costs may be recouped and reimbursed upon the sale of the parcels. As the properties are put back into tax producing status, the taxing districts will once again begin collecting real estate taxes of over \$4,448.82 per year, which will greatly increase as the properties are rehabilitated or re-developed.

**RESOLUTION NO. 003-17R:** It is requested a resolution be passed approving and accepting certain real property for acquisition into the land reutilization program; and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**B. Submitted by Amanda McClain, Housing Manager****TRANSFER OF PROPERTIES TO ERIE COUNTY LAND REUTILIZATION CORPORATION**

**Budgetary Information:** There is no cost associated with the transfer of these properties other than the total amount of staff time expended to prepare the property deeds and transfer title.

**ORDINANCE NO. 17-006:** It is requested an ordinance be passed declaring that certain real property owned by the city as part of the land reutilization program is no longer needed for any municipal purpose and authorizing the transfer of said property to the Erie County Land Reutilization Corporation for the purpose of utilizing grant funding from the Ohio Housing Finance Agency for the Neighborhood Initiative program; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**C. Submitted by Angela Byington, Planning Director****FY 2016 RESIDENTIAL DEMOLITION PROJECT #2**

**Budgetary Information:** The total estimated cost for this project including advertising and miscellaneous expenses will exceed \$10,000. The cost will be paid with FY 2016 Community Development Block Grant Funds and Insurance Fire Funds. A tax lien will be placed upon the properties for the costs of asbestos abatement and demolition.

**RESOLUTION NO. 004-17R :** It is requested a resolution be passed declaring the necessity for the city to proceed with the proposed CDBG FY 2016 residential demolition project #2; and directing the City Manager to advertise for and receive bids in relation thereto; and declaring that this Resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**D. Submitted by Kelly Kresser****NEW LIQUOR PERMIT FOR BAIT HOUSE BREWERY, LLC**

It is requested the City Commission formally file their notice not requesting a hearing for a new A1C Liquor Permit (*Manufacturer of beer – producing up to 31 million gallons per year wherever produced, for sale on premises at retail for on premises consumption, and sell beer products to retail and wholesale permit holders*) for Bait House Brewery LLC, 223 Meigs Street.

The President asked if anyone wished to remove any of the Consent Agenda Items. Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to accept the Consent Agenda and declare all ordinances and/or resolutions as drafted and presented to the City Commission under the Consent Agenda shall take effect in accordance with the Section reflected in the ordinances and/or resolutions, whether it be in accordance with Section 13 or Section 14 of the City Charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinances and resolutions: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the ordinances and resolutions contained in the Consent Agenda passed in accordance with the City Charter.

**REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS****ITEM #1 - Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer****APPROVAL TO APPLY FOR ABANDONED GAS STATION CLEANUP GRANT**

Budgetary Information: There is no impact on the city's general fund. It is anticipated that all projects undertaken as part of the grant will be paid for through grant funds.

**RESOLUTION NO. 005-17R:** It is requested a resolution be passed authorizing the filing of an application with the Ohio Development Services Agency for the abandoned gas station cleanup grant program for the former Sunoco Gas Station property located at 1651 Tiffin Avenue; and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this resolution under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

*Discussion:* Matt Lasko said the city was fortunate to be granted \$100,000 in the spring of 2016 to allow removal of two documented underground storage tanks. We have since cleared three of the four walls of these tanks, remediated the soil and demolished the gas station canopy. Through this process, we identified an undocumented, undisclosed third tank which fell outside of the funds remaining. Fortunately, the Ohio Development Services Agency still has additional funding at the state level and will be opening up the grant period in the next several days; we hope to secure another \$100,000 to finish the job.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the resolution passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

**ITEM #2 - Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer****AUTHORIZATION TO ENTER INTO OPTION TO PURCHASE AGREEMENT WITH NRP PROPERTIES, LLC**

**Budgetary Information:** The City will sell both parcels of property for a combined \$262,600. The net proceeds of which will be deposited into the City's Real Estate Development Fund.

**ORDINANCE NO. 17-007:** It is requested an ordinance be passed declaring that certain real property owned by the city located at 2513 Venice Road, identified as Parcel #58-01990.000 and 1651 Tiffin Avenue, identified as Parcel #58-02419.000 are no longer needed for any municipal purpose and authorizing the execution of an agreement with respect to that real property; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

*Discussion:* Dick Brady said we will be receiving \$262,600 for these two parcels although this will not make the city whole with the dollars we have in this property through the lost water fiasco and cleanup which we were forced to absorb. We have reached out to other commercial entities in the area and are not just giving this property to one person; we have made an effort to reach out. This is not an ideal site for a commercial property. We are close to the best use for this property with the direction the city is going. Matt Lasko said multi-family makes sense on this site for many reasons. It is on a transit corridor, it is immediately adjacent to a pharmacy with shopping across the street and within close proximity to recreational activities such as golfing. Transit can take people very quickly to Perkins Avenue and Milan Road and it makes perfect sense for multi-family housing on this site. We have heard from many folks about this being at a major intersection which provides logistical issues with shipping and receiving and other types of large trucks which would have to come in and out of the site. Although it is large enough for what is proposed to be fifty units of housing, based on the amount of parking which

would be necessary for a large commercial or retail use, four to five acres is not this large in the grand scheme of things. We do believe this is a very good use for the site, not just from a development standpoint, but for the eventual occupants of the property. Dick Brady said he wants citizens to be convinced the city has done its due diligence with this parcel and as much as he abhors the fact we are buried in cash on this fiasco, it is time to move forward and this gives us that opportunity. Matt Lasko said the most logical user for this property would be K & K Home Interiors; the city met with the owner and he expressed no interest in ownership of this site and is supportive of a multi-family housing unit. Nikki Lloyd asked if NRP applying for tax credits makes this rental and is the reason it cannot be owner-occupied. Matt Lasko said the Ohio Housing Finance Agency does not permit for lease-purchase housing in non-metro areas and Sandusky qualifies as a suburban area.

Mary Hada, Project Manager with NRP Group (NRP), said they are proposing a senior housing development. NRP started in Cleveland doing scattered site infill and have expanded fairly rapidly since 1996. NRP is a vertically integrated group with a development company, a construction company and a management company which develops 2,000 to 3,000 units each year and manages over 18,000 properties since starting. NRP has created developments in a number of states and have been in business for over twenty years. They have done single-family lease/purchase arrangements previously, but the State of Ohio has restricted this to urban areas and very confined areas in the city so they can be managed closely. They have done two- and three- story properties, garden style projects, student housing and high-end market rate housing, mostly in North Carolina, Florida and Texas. They recently completed a student housing property for the University of Toledo and have also developed senior housing in Bowling Green, Norwalk and Toledo. They have won a number of awards and are typically the housing developer of the year, or within the top ten. NRP is proposing a 41-unit, three story building along with eight cottage style units. This would be a green design building with handicap accessibility and visibility standards. There will be a community center with a fitness room, cyber café, large living room, offices and storage area for residents in the development. There will also be a walking path in the back of the property to enjoy the greenspace. This a \$9 million development and after construction, there will be a property manager and a maintenance person employed. Construction will take approximately twelve months. There will be various sources and uses with the land investment, construction bond, developer fees, and other funding to be worked out. The plan is to start by applying in March, 2017, with the State of Ohio and NRP will know about State funding by June. The financing package will then be put together with the tax credits and then they will obtain city permits and approvals. Once this has been completed, construction will begin which will take nine to twelve months. Leases normally are completed faster than anticipated and there is usually a long wait list for Phase II. These units are professionally decorated and landscaped. Dick Brady asked if financing is tied to any prevailing wage criteria and Mary Hada said it is not. Dick Brady asked if construction will be subbed out and Mary Hada said everything is subbed out with their Project Manager and Construction Superintendent. Dick Brady said this work may then be accomplished by residents of Sandusky or Erie County. Mary Hada said there is a formal bidding process met with the city to ensure everyone has the same potential to bid on the project. Greg Lockhart said he lives on the west end and appreciates this new development as the property is an eyesore. It is a huge value to senior citizens as there is direct access to transportation, a pharmacy, golfing and a new Dollar store which brings a lot of convenience to residents, including disabled persons. Mary Hada said some of the criteria first looked at with this site is the availability of amenities in the area, especially for seniors, including transportation. They have worked with the Erie County Health Department, Serving Our Seniors, the city's Transit Administrator and everyone has been amazing. Wes Poole thanked NRP for seeing there is a market here for their product and recently visited the Parsons project in Columbus which is very nice. Dennis Murray thanked Mary Hada for being here tonight and for bringing this project to Sandusky. It will be a very exciting development and he is glad to see the investment in this area which has been an eyesore for many years. This will serve a need in the community and NRP's track record indicates this will be a great product.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll**

**call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

**ITEM #3 - Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer**

**WAIVE FEES FOR NRP PROPERTIES, LLC**

**Budgetary Information:** The city will be foregoing up to \$25,000 in permitting, processing and impact fees across the Building and Engineering Departments. All permitting, processing and impact fees in excess of \$25,000 due from NRP will be paid to the city.

**RESOLUTION NO. 006-17R:** It is requested a resolution be passed authorizing the City Manager to waive certain building and engineering fees associated with the development of the property located at 2513 Venice Road, identified as Parcel #58-01990.000 and 1651 Tiffin Avenue, identified as Parcel #58-02419.000; and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Wes Poole, the Commission voted to approve this resolution under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

***Discussion:*** Dick Brady said he had some serious reservations about this legislation and is very realistic from the standpoint once we start waiving fees, it never stops. His understanding is this opportunity has a one in four chance of succeeding and the financing is tied to the city's participation in some way during the application process. Without this, the opportunity for succeeding would move to one in ten chances and will bite through his lip and vote for this legislation. Dick Brady said he would like to give this opportunity every chance to succeed and realizes without the city's help, the odds are stacked against us. Nikki Lloyd said the city has given up to about ten percent assistance with other projects and commended Matt Lasko and Maria Muratori for putting together another great package as this is only 1.5% of the total spending. This is one more way for the city to be creative and allow development and new business in town. Greg Lockhart said as we go forward and work toward our Bicentennial, we should do all we can to help out our neighborhoods. If this project helps another neighborhood, he is all for it. Wes Poole said he also agrees this project is one which unquestionably is going to be of value to citizens in the community and is more than happy to waive \$25,000 on a nine million dollar project for anyone who brings one our way. We would not have had this amount at all NRP was not making this investment in the project. Dennis Murray said he agrees this may be a bad precedent, but this is the key piece which allows the application for senior housing to be successful and this is quite justified.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the resolution passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

**ITEM #4 - Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works**

**AGREEMENT WITH STRAND ASSOCIATES, INC. FOR GREEN INFRASTRUCTURE EVALUATION, PHASE II**

**Budgetary Information:** The amount for the professional services agreement is \$65,000 which will be funded entirely with Sewer Funds and it will be incorporated into the new five-year Capital Improvement Plan and annual evaluation of sewer rates.

**ORDINANCE NO. 17-008:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an agreement for professional services with Strand Associates, Inc., of Cincinnati, Ohio, to perform a green infrastructure evaluation, Phase II of the city's General Plan for combined sewers; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

*Discussion:* Dave Waddington said this has a great chance of reducing overflow costs which keeps the EPA a day away from the city. Aaron Klein said there was a presentation about green infrastructure about two months ago and this is the next phase and is part of the EPA's CSO regulations. We are looking to prioritize projects and there may be a way to save money on the sewer side from what the EPA is trying to implement. We are trying to figure out how we would get the most bang for our buck in starting the program by doing these projects. Not only can we find the projects, but we will find the ones we already want to do in our Capital Plan and which will be most beneficial for our citizens.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

**ITEM #5 - Submitted by Casey Sparks, Assistant Planner**

**ZONE MAP AMENDMENT FOR 2513 VENICE ROAD & 1651 TIFFIN AVENUE**

**Budgetary Information:** There is no impact to the general fund.

**PASSED AT FIRST READING:** It is requested an ordinance be passed amending the official zone map of the City of Sandusky to rezone one parcel from LM (Limited Manufacturing District) and GB (General Business District) and one parcel from GB (General Business District) to RMF (Residential multi-family district).

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Greg Lockhart, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading.**

*Discussion:* Dennis Murray said this pertains to Items #3 and #4 which will allow this to happen and is also the subject of the Public Hearing held earlier regarding the change of zoning.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.**

**ITEM #6 - Submitted by Maria Muratori, Development Specialist**

**ENTERPRISE ZONE TAX ABATEMENT AGREEMENT WITH CHRIS ANDREWS DBA OHIO TRUCK SALES**

**Budgetary Information:** The project will have an ongoing positive impact on the general fund, as 25% of the increase in value will be subject to real estate taxes during the abatement period. The project will also help sustain construction jobs in the local economy and will create an estimated ten full-time equivalent employment positions in addition to the current full-time employees that will be subject to city income tax.

**ORDINANCE NO. 17-009:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an enterprise zone agreement with Chris Andrews, LLC dba Ohio Truck Sales; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

*Discussion:* Greg Lockhart said this tax abatement will help bring another business into the city and will bring jobs onto our tax rolls and supports this one hundred percent. Maria Muratori

said this company acquired property in the 1700 and 1800 block of George Street with plans to consolidate its two locations currently in Perkins Township and we have notified the Township of this relocation. Subsequently, the Tax Incentive Negotiating Committee met and approved a ten-year seventy five percent tax abatement on the appraised value of the new real improvements to the property. The Sandusky City School Board also approved the proposed tax abatement and this is the final step. Ohio Truck Sales purchases, refurbishes, cleans, paints and re-sells long haul semi-trucks and currently employs 24 full-time employees and plan to hire ten new full-time employees (minimally) by December 31, 2019. The project includes a new 13,000 SF building addition and a smaller office addition. Further enhancements include a driveway, parking lot, additional concrete work and iron fencing and gates. The real estate investment is expected to be over \$1.2 million and construction is expected to be complete by December 31, 2017. Dennis Murray thanked the owner for his investment as well as the School Board members for approving this tax abatement and allowing this kind of investment in the community.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

**ITEM #7 - Submitted by Angela Byington, Planning Director**

**AGREEMENT WITH OSBORN ENGINEERING FOR JACKSON STREET PIER PROJECT**

**Budgetary Information:** The total preliminary engineering cost, not to exceed, is \$146,043 to be initially paid with capital funds. The city intends to finance all costs associated with the Jackson Street Pier project with notes or bonds from the newly expanded urban renewal area. The notes or bonds will use proceeds from the Chesapeake TIF to pay for the debt service. Costs associated with final engineering and construction administration will require City Commission approval.

**ORDINANCE NO. 17-010:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an agreement with Osborn Engineering of Cleveland, Ohio, for professional design services for the Jackson Street Pier project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

*Discussion:* Dave Waddington said the public will be involved with the planning process and this is not happening this summer and asked Angela Byington to expand upon these conversations with other commissioners and residents. Dave Waddington said he is one of the residents who sit on the Jackson Street Pier regularly and understands there will be parking spots for residents. Angela Byington said she will speak to both Agenda Items #7 and #8 but first asked the audience for their comments. If the commission moves forward with both contracts as proposed, consideration will be given to the public comments made tonight as well as future public input in the upcoming months to shape the plan. This is simply a rendering to inspire ideas and it has already worked. The plan proposes to create an improved pier experience for residents and visitors to the city with an end plan that maintains and enhances the existing uses with our pedestrian and vehicular access ferry parking, fishing and ADA accessibility by providing a more attractive and vibrant pier. The legislation authorizes Phase I which is the preliminary engineering, planning and public outreach and participation. The preliminary engineering portions of these projects are the base and include existing condition analysis of the subsurface and sheet piling around the pier. Through discussions with Aaron Klein, they are necessary regardless of the direction the city takes for the end use of the Pier and Shoreline Drive. These projects were prioritized during the Bicentennial Visioning process last year as well as Jackson Street Pier being chosen by the Bicentennial Commission for their legacy project. The city issued a RFQ at the end of June, 2016, to locate qualified consultants who could reimagine the Pier and Shoreline Drive to improve current uses, activate existing spaces and

provide a gateway to our city from the water. Through this process, Osborn Engineering has been selected as the lead consultant. They were found to be the most qualified as well as their proposed subcontractors. These two pieces of legislation will authorize preliminary engineering, planning and the public process to consider Phase I. At its conclusion, the general deliverables are:

- A schematic design, site clearing and demolition plan
- Site layout plans
- Site utility plans
- Storm water management concept plans for detention through post-construction storm water quality
- CAD plans with details, utility grading, coordination and landscape package development
- Outline of project specifications, illustrations and renderings
- Development budget estimate

With this information, a refined scope and budget would then be developed for each project to complete detailed engineering and construction drawings which staff would ask the Commission to consider. The lump sum cost for the Jackson Street Pier is \$146,043 and Shoreline Drive will be approximately \$150,000. Both projects will be financed with no general fund money; they will be financed with notes or bonds from the Chesapeake TIF to pay for debt service.

Bonnie Teeuwen with Osborn Engineering and Alex Pesta with City Architecture then spoke to these items (#7 and #8). Osborn Engineering is celebrating its 125<sup>th</sup> anniversary this year and is the oldest privately-owned engineering firm in Ohio. For this project, they have teamed with City Architecture. Alex Pesta said City Architecture has worked with the city and its residents over the past year and were instrumental in helping create the Bicentennial Plan which was wrapped up in December, 2015. This planning work has set the stage for the next step. The Jackson Street Pier was discussed heavily in the Bicentennial Plan, notably the downtown initiatives outlined. There will be a robust public process for this at least on three occasions to gain information and collect further data about what might work on the Pier. Some of these initial ideas will then be vetted to identify preferred alternative(s) once we know what the underground utilities and other conditions are. One of the things heard through the Bicentennial process was to put a front face on the backside of the buildings along Shoreline Drive. Looking at the shoreline from Sandusky Bay, one is really looking at the “back of the house” in many cases. Some properties have done an amazing job with investments, but there are still challenges with the location of dumpsters, electrical transformers and other utilities. Through the engineering and survey work, we can identify how to work around some of these elements. When moving curb lines and fire hydrants and other infrastructure, it could become incredibly expensive and it is important to work together to find a balanced approach. The current proposal will definitively not be the final product, this was done to start conversations. We have heard programmatically what Shoreline Drive looks and feels like and it needs to become an active space to connect the city waterfront experience. Bonnie Teeuwen said Osborn Engineering will be the “reality checkers” for the project and will look at existing conditions, constructability and budget for the project before getting too far down the line. There are three parts to the project including the Northern Parklet which is the northwest corner of Chesapeake Lofts, the Shoreline Drive project and the Jackson Street Pier project. As engineers, the true ownership will be determined with surveyors. The limits of the Shoreline Drive project are from Lawrence to Franklin Streets and include parking at the intersection of Jackson and Wayne Streets. An assessment of the existing utilities needs to be undertaken first so numbers can be put with wish list items to provide a good reality check. Osborn Engineering recently partnered with City Architecture in Cuyahoga Falls for their downtown transformation. They are having discussion with contractors now for this design/build project. Alex Pesta said the Jackson Street Pier is a hot topic and thanked the [Sandusky Register](#) for publishing the conceptual renderings to continue a conversation with the community. The consultants were hired through a competitive RFP/RFQ process and multiple consulting firms were interviewed. The idea was to identify an underutilized piece of land in the downtown core and think of it in a

different way for people who live, visit and recreate by making a place for them whether in a vehicle, a wheelchair or on foot. There are 297 parking spaces on the pier according to the 2014 downtown parking study and the average utilization rate is 45%; the peak is 74% during summer months. This parking lot in the core of Sandusky's downtown is underutilized and will not attract other types of investment and initiatives needing to be addressed. This does not mean it needs to be completely revamped. Alex Pesta said he heard this area needs to cater to every single person whether they are handicapped or need accessible spaces or are seniors. They need a drivable experience and people need to park and have views of Sandusky Bay while working with Sandusky, it has been a very open and transparent process and many people came to the public meetings leading up to the Bicentennial process. Alex Pesta said they are done planning for this piece of property; we now need to roll up our sleeves and design it. On the Jackson Street Pier, Bonnie Teeuwen said geotechnical borings need to be performed to determine exactly what the material is as well as the condition of the sheeting which has never been inspected. This space can aspire to be like Cleveland's Public Square which Osborn Engineering was the engineer of record for. This was highlighted during the Republican National Convention and started with a utility project as a large portion of the budget was for utilities and utility relocation. The city and Osborn Engineering need to team together early on to address all of the engineering and utility issues at an early stage. It will be important to know how people will interact with the space and there are things to be learned from Public Square and other public spaces and places like it. This could become a Bayfront Plaza, possibly with an observation deck, splash pad, dining and more. Vista parking and vehicular access are clearly on this list and need to be part of the consideration. As far as where the drive loop might occur, this is all on the table and yet to be designed and engineered. Many conversations will be had to include the Army Corps of Engineers, the ferry boat operators, the general public, and many more. From this process, project costs and potential funding sources will be looked at. Programming has not yet been determined and this is part of the public process to make sure it is reflective of the community goals and desires.

Greg Lockhart said the East Fourth Street area in Cleveland was mentioned and this is similar to how he sees Shoreline Drive. The boardwalk project is somewhat exclusive to Sandusky's existing businesses and it is at a higher level/elevation than a pedestrian walk. Small businesses are the backbone of America and our communities and we should do whatever we can to foster them. We should encourage the walking, pedestrians and shopping to all of the businesses along Shoreline Drive and if we create a space for vendors and bodegas, rather than building the boardwalk, we could use the money to activate the rear of these buildings so they can do business from the backside and add awnings like East Fourth Street in Cleveland. On the north side, perhaps there could be bodegas to create an experience for residents walking in this area. People who work in the downtown area might enjoy going out and taking a stroll to have lunch or make purchases and this would create a draw for people to come down. On the Jackson Street Pier, Greg Lockhart said he is sensitive to ADA issues and what they believe in and traversing to the end of the Pier can be extremely cumbersome for someone in a wheelchair or someone who cannot get out of their car and we need to be conscious of this going forward. Greg Lockhart asked where the extra parking will be placed that will be taken away on the Pier and perhaps there will be more participants if we create an attraction here. Greg Lockhart said to also consider opening this up to transient boaters and we should want to market what we already have while being mindful of people we would like to come to our city while being respectful of the people who live here. We are a boating community, but have yet to provide anything here for the boaters. There are a lot of older residents who do not want to see anything done to this pier while there are younger ones who do and there is an age discrepancy. We need to make sure we respect what we have always had (attracting young families while keeping this accessible for older residents). Wes Poole asked about the geotechnical work and base mapping; Bonnie said geotechnical engineering is where large holes are dug and core samples are taken to evaluate the soil condition and strength. Base mapping is laying out plans with a surveyor and putting information into CAD to make a base map with elevations, placements of buildings and curb lines to create detailed drawings. Wes Poole said that would cover \$50,000 of this contract for Shoreline Drive and asked what the additional money is for. Bonnie said this is for base mapping for Shoreline Drive and base mapping and general engineering including utilities and design for rehab of the roadway and

the Pier. They will also coordinate all of these items with City Architecture as to where this falls within their conceptual ideas. Wes Poole said he is trying to figure out the purpose of this; Alex Pesta showed an example of design conceptual drawings which show where pavement is, where potential landscaping can be, ADA compliance, site amenities, etc., as well as a preliminary estimate for the project. Aaron Klein said on the proposal, there are 24 items under preliminary engineering including survey and geotechnical work, plus 22 items to be covered by the \$69,900 significant other work to create something which can be utilized toward the next step of final design. Naomi Twine said she appreciates all of the public comments made and staff work done and said it is important for the commission to understand what it is the public wants so they are not simply running down a road which no one really wants. It is important for us to see what we have before we start making plans for what we want. Naomi Twine said she is 53 years old and does not recall the city taking these types of steps toward planning for community and neighborhood, and opportunities for our citizens to have an area for recreation, but does remember a mall being built when she was young in Perkins Township. Naomi Twine said she appreciates all the steps the city is taking to present a community which not only our citizens want to live and thrive in, but to draw other people into. Her daughter is 28 years old and when she graduated from college, had no desire to return here, and would like to have things in the community to draw young people back to the area. The city has traditions and we are building upon them and said this is an important project for the city and would like to see it continue forward. Nikki Lloyd said she will abstain on Items #7 and #8 as she owns adjacent property. Dick Brady said the newspaper's headline captured the essence of where we are today: "Pier Speculation", as this is what we are talking about, speculation. This should calm everyone's nerves a little. The reality is, we owe our forefathers a debt of gratitude as in 1978, they took one million dollars to increase the size of this pier by about forty percent and this asset was delivered to us by doing this. The Jackson Street Pier is now valued at \$10 – \$15 million if we had to create it. Spending \$300,000 on a \$15 million asset is money very well spent. He has worked in practically every building on Shoreline Drive, on both sides of the street, and we are getting a bargain on the engineering. The utilities are a nightmare, not excluding the electrical boxes and sewer lines, and this is one thing Osborn Engineering will be sorting out for their services. This City Commission is not good at doing nothing, and thinks we will continue with very good guidance from both City Architecture and Osborn Engineering. Wes Poole asked with regard to the geotechnical work and the underwater work at the Pier if this will tell the city what we actually have and Bonnie affirmed it will. Bonnie said this will also tell us where the utilities are and who owns them or if there are any lease agreements involving them. Wes Poole said he can support the \$82,720 for the study at the first phase to tell the city what it has; after this point, we are dealing with what we have done before and he is a little nervous. The commission has expressed utilizing the Pier for people to drive to the end, yet it is being proposed again to reduce the parking from 290 to 81 spaces without access to the north end. There have been three conceptual drawings since the initial one and yet still there is no access to the end. We keep talking about hearing and listening to the people, yet it does not seem to be coming to fruition. We did a study which identified the ownership on the northwest side of Chesapeake (Parklet) with a complete set of drawings to place a fountain here, but it was decided not to do this for several reasons and he has a problem paying to have this done again. Likewise, several years ago, the Main Street Association had a study performed involving Shoreline Drive which is sitting on a shelf waiting to be looked at. At the end of the day, if we do the underwater and geotechnical work, we can then have the conversation to decide what we want to do. We need to ask ourselves how many spaces will we leave on the pier to support the businesses which are here and this is a finite number. We then have to identify where we will park or move other spaces that we are taking away and where they will park. No one can make this up for us, we have to sit down as a community and identify it; spending \$200,000 for another conceptual drawing takes us another step closer to still have to finish these items and does not make sense to him. Phase I and Phase II are not part of this contract and recommends not passing this as written. Wes Poole suggested getting the engineering study to know what is here and have a conversation with the community about what they would like to do, settle it, and then specifically look for what we need. Paying people to do a general survey of utilities is an improper spending of city funds and is one more study that will sit next to the one done similar to it. This was not thought through well enough and there is no indication we will actually gain from it. Dennis Murray said as part of the Bicentennial Planning process, we

looked at all of the prior drawings and studies and the difference between what we are looking at here tonight and these earlier drawings was the engineering work which is critical to take the next step forward. We have to take one step at a time although they are sometimes more expensive than others. Alex Pesta said there was a study done which included conceptual items, but where these studies left off and where this one picks up provides no overlap in the scope. These other studies stopped at conceptual ideas and were the result of those other planning processes. This planning, design and engineering process is intended to start at this point and progress to where the city can put shovels in the ground because we cannot do this now. There is engineering to be done, investment to be made and this will be expensive, complicated and technical. In order to go through the processes for this to occur, we only have hand drawn sketches. These have good content and intent, but a project cannot be built with intent, it has to be engineered. Bonnie said we know by visual inspection, the west end of Shoreline Drive floods and there have been attempts to correct this. As engineers, Osborn Engineering actually does calculations to determine how much water is coming in to provide an engineering concept to minimize it. This needs to be done early on and is just one example of what we need to include in this phase. Dennis Murray said he appreciates the breadth of discussion on all of these items. Wes Poole said what is also of issue with him is he does not consider it to be a very high priority in terms of the things we need to do for the city. As we see more and more private investment downtown, we need to be looking at how to make it successful. We should be looking at things like parking as we have an alleyway which is a mess downtown near the recently purchased Cooke building and perhaps we might want to invest in this. Likewise, the parking lot between Civista Bank and the buildings along Columbus Avenue are the kinds of things the city should be investing their money in as they will pay off much better in the long run. This will also leverage private funds. We should be looking at putting in WiFi, parking and other things to increase safety; investing in the Jackson Street Pier is not going to move one person downtown. People who left Sandusky did not do so because their downtown looked better than ours. For us to invest this kind of money just downtown does not make sense and he will vote no to keep this as a package. Wes Poole said he fully supports the idea to do the engineering. Eric Wobser said the Bicentennial Plan was adopted through the Comprehensive Plan which showed the conceptual rendering done but City Architecture has not been working on this for several months since. They did this rendering as part of their application process to show what the Pier might look like without the benefit of the conversations had from December, 2015 through today. We have already begun discussions, should these items pass, about how we can take the feedback we are getting into account and still deliver a great park which meets the community input. We have talked a lot about plans for Sandusky which did not happen and Eric Wobser said he was part of an advisory group for the Cleveland Public Square project in 2007 which was finally completed in August, 2016. These projects need a significant amount of time and the more the phases are broken up or scaled back, the less likely for them to get done. Eric Wobser said he has been doing economic development for over a decade and the greenspace does not include backyards or front porches and this is one of the most important things we can do. When surveying people about moving into downtown urban environments, or for developers who are already making investments in Sandusky, they absolutely want to see improved greenspace on the waterfront and will be able to figure out the parking situation. Eric Wobser said he believes every bit of planning done in the past two years is based on best practices for downtown and waterfront development. Dennis Murray said it is time to take these projects and studies off the shelf and put them into action and this is the step we are taking. There is no other way to move this forward and told a story about his grandfather's pond and a stick of dynamite which stunned the fish. Dennis Murray said Angela Byington has thrown the stick of dynamite into the pond and this is exactly what we were after. Wes Poole said as we move forward, we should ask who is the arbiter of deciding what is best for Sandusky. There is the vote of the majority on the commission, but there are individuals with different priorities for what we should do. We are not holding Sandusky back into the 20<sup>th</sup> century and some people talk as though what is best for Sandusky is only what comes out of their mouths. There are some who would like a little piece of what makes us comfortable. Up to today, there has been a public meeting and presentation about what we plan to do, questions have been asked about what was presented which was followed by not wanting to hold people very long, so we are done. Wes Poole said he is pretty happy with whatever we do, but for those who are sure the development is the

only thing that will make Sandusky a better place for people to live, recognize there is more than just “you” who wish to live here.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray and Dave Waddington, 5. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. Abstain: Nikki Lloyd, 1. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray and Dave Waddington, 5. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. Abstain: Nikki Lloyd, 1. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

**ITEM #8 - Submitted by Angela Byington, Planning Director**

**AGREEMENT WITH OSBORN ENGINEERING FOR SHORELINE DRIVE PROJECT**

**Budgetary Information:** The total preliminary engineering cost, not to exceed, is \$150,042 to be initially paid with capital funds. The city intends to finance all costs associated with the Shoreline Drive rehabilitation project with notes or bonds from the newly expanded urban renewal area. The notes or bonds will use proceeds from the Chesapeake TIF to pay for the debt service. Costs associated with final engineering and construction administration will require City Commission approval.

**PASSED AT FIRST READING:** It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into an agreement with Osborn Engineering of Cleveland, Ohio for professional design services for the Shoreline Drive rehabilitation project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

***Discussion:*** Greg Lockhart asked if both of these projects (Item #7 and Item #8) will be handled at the same time. Bonnie Teeuwen with Osborn Engineering said the preference would be to do both at the same time as there is a cost advantage. Alex Pesta said both are related and if there are concerns or community impacts to be considered, one may impact the other. It can be managed either way but efficiencies will be lost. Greg Lockhart said when people go on vacation, they go places where they might want to live and that is what we need to do here. We need to make people say they **want** to live here and how amazing it is and wants to see this going into the Bicentennial. Dave Waddington asked about the rail underneath the Shoreline Drive pavement and Aaron Klein said it is our intention to remove it as it deteriorates the pavement so much faster and this would be similar to the Columbus Avenue project completed last year. Dennis Murray said given the proximity to his office, he will abstain from voting on this project.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart and Dave Waddington, 4. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. Abstain: Dennis Murray and Nikki Lloyd, 2. The President declared the motion failed under Section 14. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart and Dave Waddington, 4. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. Abstain: Dennis Murray and Nikki Lloyd, 2. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.**

**ITEM #9 - Submitted by Brad Link, Director of Public Services**

**2017 TREE REMOVAL & TRIM PROJECT**

**Budgetary Information:** The engineer’s estimate for this project is \$68,750 and will be paid from the capital projects fund. This project was made possible through Issue 8 funding.

**RESOLUTION NO. 007-17R:** It is requested a resolution be passed declaring the necessity for the city to proceed with the proposed 2017 tree removal and trim project; approving the specifications and engineer’s estimate of cost thereof; and directing the City Manager to advertise for and receive bids in relation thereto; and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the city charter.

**Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this resolution under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

**Discussion:** Dave Waddington asked about the process we are looking at for this project and Brad Link said this will allow the city to go out for bid. Brad Link said residents can call the Public Services office regarding issues with trees. Greg Lockhart said he has heard there was some concern about how the city is taking down trees in relation to the sidewalk program and feels well versed on how we are doing this. In addition, the Tree Commission has identified some trees which do not need to be removed and there is a process to ensure we are only removing trees which are necessary, and vice versa. Aaron Klein said the tree program is being coordinated with our sidewalk program and the city's Arborist is looking at performing a brief write-up and recommendation for every single tree next year. Brad Link said if this legislation passes, the bid document will be released to remove trees and then replant others. The idea is to take our urban canopy, remove the dead, dying or dangerous trees and trim others to promote health and growth and make them stronger. The new trees will be planted so as to allow the wind to move through them so they do not come down in these types of situations.

**Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the resolution: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the resolution passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.**

#### **CITY MANAGER'S REPORT**

- **Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$25 for the Police Department Trust Fund from the Solowiej family in memory of William Nixon. The President declared the motion passed.**
- Many **Bicentennial Committees** are up and running and working on their individual responsibilities. Below is a breakdown of what each is working on.
  - *Marketing Committee:* Bicentennial website and getting quotes in the upcoming weeks as well as creating a merchandise and social media campaign.
  - *Bicentennial Ball Committee:* Solidifying a contract with Cedar Point as to the needs of the event. We recently received word the occupancy of the ballroom is 915 people which exceeds our needs and will offer enough room for comfort and entertainment.
  - *History Committee:* Has created many walking tours and looks to expand them over time. This group is creating a speaker series and exhibits. Finally one of the big pushes is to connect history and technology and incorporate the youth.
  - *Community Involvement Committee:* Having its kickoff meeting within the next couple of weeks. The intention of this group is to gather the schools, churches, and community organizations and ask how they would like to celebrate Sandusky's Bicentennial in their own unique way as well as connect them with the resources of the Bicentennial Commission.
  - *Capital Projects Committee:* The city is leading the charge on capital infrastructure projects.

The Bicentennial Commission has prioritized public art and citywide beautification projects, as well as Jackson Street Pier, to be a legacy project.

- A **barking dog warning** form has been implemented at the Police Department. If a barking dog call comes in, an officer will be dispatched. The officer will determine if there is an issue and take appropriate action pursuant to the time limits in the ordinance. The resident will be notified if home. If the resident is absent, the form will be left at the residence to notify them of the issue. In addition, if the citizen who is complaining has video or audio footage of the dog barking and it encompasses the time limit per the city Ordinance 519.10(e) Domesticated or caged non-farm animals may not bark, squeal, crow, howl, or make any other such noises for more than five minutes if continuous or more than fifteen minutes if intermittent, then the footage can and should be retained by

the officer. Prosecutor Lynne Gast-King advised she would use this for prosecution, if such footage exists.

- Two **Fire Fighter/Paramedics were recently hired** to replace two employees who left the Department. Douglas Martin started January 26, 2017 and Nicholas Westlake started January 27, 2017.
- The next scheduled **Finance Committee meeting** is Friday, February 24, 2017, at 7:45 a.m.
- Our **Water Treatment Plant**, Big Island Water Works, processes millions of gallons of water a day for the city and the rest of Erie County. Earlier this month the Ohio Army National Guard visited BIWW to establish a partnership with the city and explore the potential to treat and transport water to nearby communities in times of emergency, like the algal bloom crisis in 2014 which left some Toledo residents without access to running water for days. Over a dozen Army personnel traveled to Sandusky with a convoy of vehicles, including a 2,000 gallon water supply tank, and it was a sight to see; the 237th Brigade Support Battalion was grateful to BIWW staff and the Department of Public Works for providing this unique training experience.
- The **combination fuel engine at the Waste Water Treatment Plant** was rebuilt according to emergency approval granted by the commission in August. The engine and pump have been in full operation since December 28, 2016. Once again, it is serving as the main pumping system at the plant.
- There will be **public meeting regarding transient rentals** on **January 30** beginning at 6 p.m. at Sandusky High School, Room 300. City staff will present general alternatives regarding regulations and public input will be sought.
- There will be a presentation on the individual proposed neighborhood plans for the **Sandusky Neighborhood Initiative**, beginning at 10 a.m. on Saturday February 18 in the State Room of the Sandusky State Theatre. We have received a \$350,000 grant from The Dorn Foundation for this effort. Citizens are invited to attend one or all of the neighborhood presentations, as all six neighborhood plans will be presented back to back with a lunch provided from 12 p.m. – 1 p.m. Flyers with specific times for each neighborhood are located at the rear of the room. Notice and times will also be advertised in the Sandusky Register and will be posted on the city website. The following are the times for the specific neighborhood presentations:
  - First through Fifth Streets – 10 a.m.
  - Cove District - 11 a.m.
  - South of Kilbourne 1 p.m.
  - Garden District - 2 p.m.
  - Westside - 3 p.m.
  - Southside - 4 p.m.
- The Department of Community Development is now accepting applications for **Housing Development and Beautification assistance for 2017**. The city fully expended all \$250,000 in 2016 and is currently projecting \$300,000 will be available for 2017. Applications will be accepted on a rolling basis until all funds are exhausted. Newly revised applications are available on the city's website or can be picked up in person in the Department of Community Development. Questions about the program or eligibility requirements may be directed to Maria Muratori at [mmuratori@ci.sandusky.oh.us](mailto:mmuratori@ci.sandusky.oh.us), or 419.627.5891. Greg Lockhart said while speaking to citizens about this program, some are having a hard time filling out the applications and asked staff to host an open house to explain how to fill these out. This will take place on February 15 at 5:30 p.m. at the Central Fire Station.

- The next **Planning Commission meeting** is scheduled for January 25; a special Planning Commission regarding recreational vehicle parking and zoning regulations concerning chickens will be held on February 1 at 4:30 p.m. in the first floor conference room.
- The next **Landmark Commission meeting** is scheduled for January 25 following the Planning Commission meeting in the first floor conference room.
- The next **Board of Zoning Appeals meeting** is scheduled for February 16 at 4:30 p.m. in the first floor conference room.

### **OLD BUSINESS**

Nikki Lloyd said she would like to take a moment to commend the Commissioners who were able to vote on the legislation regarding the **Jackson Street Pier and Shoreline Drive** tonight who see the future. As we go forward, and whether one has developed a property or not, staff knows what it takes and is trying to bring the city through the proper steps to get to the final product. It has been a great first year with ups and downs and through the city's boards and commissions, we have made some good decisions, but on other topics, we could have done a better job. The Jackson Street Pier rendering has been circulating on social media over the weekend and has received a lot of attention. We need to keep in mind this is just one possibility and encouraged everyone to keep an open mind and take note to keep moving forward to attract new residents and businesses and make them feel welcome. This is not going to just be the Jackson Street Pier project. We need to keep our city clean, make our downtown attractive for business and leisure, be good neighbors and work together through this process. We have an opportunity to attract so many to our area and the Pier and Shoreline Drive projects are fantastic opportunities for community gathering spaces. The Navy Pier in Chicago or Mallory Square in Key West were brought up and these are places to run into people and we can still keep this as a gathering space while making improvements to it to make it better. For those who say they want to drive up to the water, the new parking that will exist on the pier will still allow people to eat in their car and see the water. There may be a beautiful park to view as well, or one can drive to Lions Park. Sandusky has so many spaces to go to including the Shelby Street Boat Ramp facility, Shoreline Park and the Paper District Marina to catch a view of Sandusky Bay while eating lunch regardless of temperature. A lot has been said about handicap accessibility tonight and if we focus on this, many will be happy with the Jackson Street Pier makeover. For those who think she is just saying this because she owns property across the street, Nikki Lloyd said she would like them to know she and her husband moved back because they wanted to help Sandusky and know the potential to attract many more to the area including the gentleman who recently purchased many properties in the downtown. She and her husband had no plans to open a hotel downtown, but Sandusky needed it and that is why they are here and have confidence in what the staff is trying to do. People will continue to see change, streets improved, new sidewalks, neighborhood improvements and trees being removed and planted. It has been almost one year since a smoking ban was addressed in parks and children play on playgrounds and are all over our parks. The amount of cigarette butts in Shoreline Park this weekend was astonishing. Not only are people smoking here, they are also littering. The last time this issue came to the table, someone made the statement it takes away personal liberties. We all need to look to ourselves and ask about our personal liberty to breathe fresh air. Last year, Glenwood Springs, Colorado, put a smoking ban in their downtown area, parks and trails. Boulder, Colorado has had a smoking ban in town for years. Sue Daugherty mentioned tonight Sandusky needs to be a trendsetter. Pete Schade said we need to start doing things so other people follow and it would be nice to bring Sandusky into the 21<sup>st</sup> century and implement some of these things. Since joining the commission, Nikki Lloyd has been told Sandusky is not ready for this yet and hopes to never hear this statement again. Sandusky is ready and Sandusky needs it. We have our transient meetings set up and hopes to see people at these. At the last public meeting about rentals, people had a lot to say and asks to join and listen and hear what is being presented. We need to be open-minded to move forward and some issues being brought up could be addressed simply by being a good neighbor. Also, some issues cannot be changed and asked for support of decisions best for this city as a whole and not just a personal situation.

**NEW BUSINESS**

Naomi Twine said she wished to thank citizens who came out for the recent **Commission Office Hours** on January 11. This was a good meeting and issues and concerns are being addressed and looks forward to scheduling another one in February.

Dick Brady said he and Dave Waddington hosted a **Coffee with Commissioner** and 18 residents showed up with issues and concerns which were distributed to staff for resolution or input. This will be relocated into the City Commission Chambers at City Hall in the future as there are sometimes larger groups of people as it is a hindrance to Mr. Smith's.

Wes Poole said as we move forward, we should ask who is the arbiter of deciding what is best for Sandusky. There is the vote of the majority on the commission, but there are individuals with different priorities for what we do. We are not holding Sandusky back into the 20<sup>th</sup> century and some people talk as though what is best for Sandusky is only what comes out of their mouths. There are some who would like a little piece of what makes us comfortable. What has happened up to now is there will be a public meeting and presentation about what we plan to do, questions on what was presented, followed by not wanting to hold people very long so we are done. Wes Poole said he is pretty happy with whatever we do, but for those who are sure the development is the only thing that will make Sandusky a better place for people to live, recognize there is more than just "you" who wish to live here.

Dick Brady said he has asked Eric Wobser, Code Enforcement and Police Department staff members to **declare a war on vehicles illegally parked on grass**. This is a law on our books and we have neglected its enforcement for far too long; this is a war on mobile blight. Dick Brady said he is not interested in harming these people financially or making their lives uncomfortable, he is interested in getting cars off of lawns and to prosecute this correctly, we will have to get our feet under us with assistance from different departments. It may take a while to get a game plan together, but anticipates this will happen in the next 60 days. This will not be tolerated and we will be taking action on these issues. Greg Lockhart asked for clarification about parking on the grass as there are some areas where it may not be clear what is grass and what is not. Dick Brady said when he travels to work in the morning, there are twelve cars parked on people's lawns or grass and wonders what their good neighbors must think about this.

**Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to hold an executive session regarding imminent litigation. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed.**

**Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to hold an executive session regarding personnel, City Manager. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Dave Waddington, Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 7. The President declared the motion passed.**

**AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION**

Tim Schwanger, 362 Sheffield Way, said he was born and raised in Sandusky and at one time, local citizens and visitors were able to drive onto the Meigs Street Pier to park and enjoy the sunset and views, but this was taken away around 1988 or 1989 when Sandusky Bay Development took over Battery Park. If one is parked at Lions Park, they are only looking at one third of Sandusky Bay. The Jackson Street Pier is the last location where the handicapped, the disabled and elderly can park at the water's edge and view the entire Bay except for the very east end. In February of last year, City Architecture came up with plans for the Jackson Street Pier and people asked about the parking at the north end; this was also discussed at Bayfront Corridor Committee meetings and he does not understand why we are looking at basically the same plan almost one year later. There is a possibility we may be dredging the Jackson Street Slip for the Jiimaan and asked if we have determined this a necessity.

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said she heard a committee had been formed regarding the Justice Center and asked who made these appointments and if she is able to attend these meetings. Dennis Murray said the City Manager selected the advisory committee members and they have no formal authority. Justin Harris said unless a committee is set up by ordinance or by the commission, it does not require minutes and cannot speak to who the City Manager has on an advisory committee to get advice; this is not an open meeting. Sharon Johnson said she is concerned about how Issue 8 money is being spent and said the city is giving a \$450,000 Issue 8 grant to the developer downtown for City Hall. We have \$400,000 more in an Issue 8 grant on hold if the developer does not get [his] credits (Historic Tax Credits) and this is a lot of money to give away. Sharon Johnson said she recently learned through these grants, one company received a \$35,000 grant for a mural on the side of their building and asked how essential this is. Dennis Murray said at the same time the citizens approved Issue 8, a piece of legislation was tied to this which the commission adopted to increase the admissions tax. One of the things we discussed was what Issue 8 monies would be used for as opposed to what the additional admissions tax monies would be used for. The economic development dollars, as part of a deal brokered at the time was half would be devoted to economic development. Eric Wobser said one of the things very important to Cedar Point during the Issue 8 campaign was forty percent of the city's general fund was paid directly by Cedar Point or its employees; they were very alarmed this was a high amount and if the city did not diversify its economy, it would cause them to have to consider how invested they could remain in the area. Cedar Point asked the city to set aside one half of the admissions tax (98% of which is paid by guests to Cedar Point) for economic development purposes to help broaden our tax base and not be so dependent upon them. Wes Poole asked if the city approved a \$35,000 amount for a mural. Matt Lasko said as part of the collective financial package with Imagine baking, exterior painting at the facility was included. There was also a complete reconstruction of the roofs on the shipping bays and the building of a wall on the interior of the property to devise gluten-free production. As part of this total project, they are doing a \$35,000 mural but the city is not paying for the percentage brought up this evening. Part of the painting of the building included a mural on portions of the property. Greg Lockhart said this project will beautify a neighborhood which is blighted in the city and goes out into the Hancock Street area. Imagine Bakery will be repainting the entire exterior of the building and a mural will enhance the property and could be a catalyst to launch what others do in the area.

**At 7:59 p.m., the President announced a recess of the regular session. At 8:05 p.m., the commission went into executive session. At 8:47 p.m., the commission returned to open session and the President announced the meeting was adjourned.**

---

Kelly L. Kresser, CMC  
Commission Clerk

---

Dennis E. Murray, Jr.  
President of the City Commission