

Dennis Murray called the meeting to order at 5 p.m., after the Invocation, given by Greg Lockhart, and the Pledge of Allegiance. Greg Lockhart recognized local African American heroes in recognition of Black History Month: former City Commissioners Thomas Darden, Al Mason, Leroy Sizemore, Dannie Edmon, Brett Fuqua, Sr., Pervis Brown, Jr., Diedre Cole and present Commissioners Naomi Twine, Wes Poole and himself (Greg Lockhart).

The Clerk called the roll and the following Commissioners responded: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington.

City staff present: Dave Degnan – Fire Chief, Phil Frost – Acting Police Chief, Aaron Klein – Public Works Director, Matt Lasko – Chief Development Officer, Angela Byington – Planning Director, Brad Link – Public Service Director, Don Rumbutis – IT, Stuart Hamilton – IT Manager, Justin Harris – Law Director, Hank Solowiej – Finance Director, Eric Wobser – City Manager and Kelly Kresser – Commission Clerk.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve the minutes of the February 13, meeting and suspend the formal reading. The President declared the motion passed.

PRESENTATION

A short introductory video in the Bicentennial Pioneer Series was shown featuring **Bethany Copp and Justin Anderson with Harbour Creek Designs**. Justin Anderson thanked the city for being good to them. Greg Lockhart said he appreciates the investment in the City of Sandusky and believes small business is the backbone of America and hopes the city can do everything it can to facilitate them inside the city. Bethany Copp said Harbour Creek Designs makes custom furniture and uses ideas for people's homes using solid wood and local materials.

Chief Dave Degnan said he would like **to recognize Police Officers Robert Gardin and Carissa Cruz** Staff in the Fire Department has always had a great working relationship with our police counterparts, but two recent incidents stand out. The first was an incident involving a shooting with two victims. While there were several officers there working together, I had direct contact with two of them. Officer Rob Gardin was in the parking lot which was in a state of absolute chaos. He was approached by Captain Jason Roesch to ascertain the location of the victims, and even with everything going on around them, and with no shooter in custody, he gave Captain Roesch directions with absolute calm, politeness and professionalism. Officer Gardin's demeanor helped to put Captain Roesch and the rest of the crew at ease and allowed us to focus on their jobs. When Captain Roesch entered the establishment, he found Officer Carissa Cruz with the patient, administering aid. She had obtained a belt from someone and used it as a tourniquet to control bleeding from a leg injury. The placement was precise and correct, and was working very well. As the ambulance had not yet arrived, he asked if she was able to maintain the tourniquet while the other patient was located. The other patient was located and found to have a minor injury, and was directed to the EMS crew (both squads had just arrived on scene), while the other crew was directed to the first patient. Patient care was transferred and continued without incident. Officer Cruz did an excellent job that evening and may have even saved the patient's life. The second incident was at a drug overdose call. There were numerous EMS calls occurring at the same time, and this incident required an ambulance from another district to respond. Engine 921 responded, as did Captain Roesch about one minute later. He arrived to find Engine 921's crew working, with Officers Gardin and Cruz right alongside. Officer Gardin was tending to a very emotional bystander and was able to get them to leave the room, staying with them and explaining what we were doing while also comforting them. This gained SFD personnel valuable room, allowed them to communicate more easily, and also assured them that a potential second patient was being monitored and taken care of. Officer Cruz had already administered Narcan intra-nasally, and was now ventilating the patient, with very good technique, using a BVM. This was allowing two other crew members to tend to other needs for the patient. Officer Cruz continued to provide ventilations until the patient became responsive. The actions of these Police

Officers, and all Police Officers, have always been impressive, but in these two cases they were outstanding.

Dennis Murray said the commission wished to **recognize Chief Dave Degnan** as this is his last meeting and he is, sadly, retiring from the Sandusky Fire Department and presented a Proclamation; Greg Lockhart presented a retirement gift to Chief Degnan. Dave Degnan thanked everyone including the citizens and staff members of the city and said it has been an honor to work with his co-workers. He has come to work every single day and loved when a call came in because if he could help someone or make their day better, that has been the best part of this job. The SFD is in very good hands with Captain D'Amico who is going to be Interim Fire Chief and he (Chief Degnan) is always willing to help out.

Justin Harris said one of the projects he was tasked with completing was a thorough review and assessment of the forty-four (44) boards, commissions and committees his predecessor, Don Iscman, had undertaken prior to his retirement. While this was an important project on the Law Department's to-do-list, it was pushed to the forefront at the December 12, 2016, commission meeting when a motion was passed, directing the City Manager to direct the Law Department to review city-appointed boards and commissions and provide training as the Law Department determined to be needed and to make recommendations for improving the effectiveness of the boards and commissions. An integral part to accomplishing these task was to acquire a complete understanding of the boards' creation, makeup, purpose and working relationship with other boards. In researching these boards, it was discovered the term periods for all 44 boards differed from two years, three years, five years or no terms. It was also discovered some boards were created but never met. Some boards were created to address a certain issue or project which had reached a resolution thereby making the board obsolete. Some boards overlapped with regard to the function and purpose of other boards and would better serve the city if combined. While other boards appeared to not know their purpose and function, and needed either revamped, guidance by way of codifying or spelling out their function, or guidance by way an orientation to its members. Prior to any orientation taking place, the law department thought it would be prudent to have the City Commission through the proposed ordinances tonight, provide consistency throughout the boards and commission by way of terms, combine boards that need to be combined, create boards that have never been officially created but necessary, repeal boards that have served their purpose, revamp certain boards and commissions based upon extensive research conducted from other municipalities facing the same issues, and provide legislation clarifying certain boards' purpose and function where it may not have been as clear in the past. An example of combining boards would be the ADA/Fair Housing Board. An example of providing consistency with respect to terms would be the Bayfront Corridor Committee, which had no terms. An example of combining and creating a board would be the proposed Economic Development Incentive Committee to would combine the Economic Development Review Committee (which had never been created by a codified ordinance) with the Revolving Loan Committee. This would allow one economic development board to be responsible for providing support and financial assistance to Sandusky business (with Commission's final approval, however) whether it be in the form of a grant or loan. An example of eliminating a commission on the books only, would be the Sandusky Youth Commission. It was discovered in our review of this Commission it was created at the request of former Commissioner Cole in 2011 yet since its inception, it has never met; yet the ordinance requires a composition of 21 Sandusky High School students that will help advise the City Commission when requested on matters pertaining to the youth population, as well as monitor current municipal youth activities. Our recommendation to eliminate the youth commission as being obsolete is not a recommendation to forget about the youth. Rather, it is an acknowledgement with the current leadership of our local schools, the hiring of a Neighborhood Outreach Coordinator is only a few years removed from his days as a Sandusky High School student, and a strong recreational department, we believe that the City and the Schools will continue provide civic opportunities to the youth. Justin Harris said another committee which appears to have garnered controversy is the purported elimination of the HRC. After attending a meeting in May, 2016, two questions were posed and were the topic of debate including: "What's our purpose and function?", and "What are we legally allowed to do?"

Following this meeting, Commissioner Twine (the liaison), met and discussed potential ways to help provide answers to these questions. After speaking with Commissioner Twine, Justin Harris said he conducted research of other municipalities even more diverse than the City of Sandusky like Cincinnati, Cleveland, Columbus, Chicago, Toledo and reviewed their municipal boards and commissions and how they functioned and served their respective municipality in advising the City on ways to help eliminate discrimination or to remove the effects of past discrimination. The Law Department drafted an ordinance that did not eliminate an advisory committee to the city to help address human relations issue, but simply spelled out the purpose and function of the group—as well as spell out what powers the committee legally has as a City of Sandusky board and commission. Legally, whenever an entire ordinance is being revamped or replaced, the prior ordinance is repealed. In this instance, we are not eliminating the HRC, but amending and giving it a new name, and like a lot of the other boards and commissions, establishing the composition of board by way of numbers on the board and expertise offered to the board (clergy and members of a non-profit).

Naomi Twine said she looks forward to having more conversations about this legislation and as a commissioner, looks at what is important for the community at large and completely understands she would not be sitting here had it not been for the work of the Human Relations Commission (HRC). In the 1960's, during the Civil Rights movement, the HRC was instrumental in providing opportunities for African Americans and it was apropos for Commissioner Lockhart to go through those African Americans who have served on the commission. Thinking about this moving ahead, a lot of us can relate to the headlines nationwide with heightened discrimination and prejudices and attacks against persons of various religious faiths (Muslims, Jews). Naomi Twine said she wanted to put together a restructuring of the HRC so there are opportunities of multi-faith, multi-religions, multi-backgrounds and economic levels to be part of it. One of the things done across the board with many of the Boards and Commissions was to have seven persons on the newly-composed HRC two from a non-profit entity, two members of the clergy and three citizens from the community at large to diversify the true meaning of the new Community Relations Commission (CRC). This would allow for their work within the community of different economic backgrounds, faith backgrounds and social backgrounds to all have a seat at the table. This would not only work for the black community, it would work for all in the community because we are rapidly diversifying our communities and have to be open to diversity. We cannot just narrow our focus to the historical presentation of the HRC, we have to be very mindful of this because some people here would not be if not for their work in the past. Building upon this foundation and moving forward is a way we can diversify the CRC, get people at the table involved to allow for a more diverse representation of what this community is. We are doing a lot of things in the city and want to be open to various, diverse backgrounds. Justin Harris said after all of the board and commission legislation is voted upon tonight, they will be brought back for a second reading as necessary to allow the public to present questions or concerns. After these are finalized, the next step for the Law Department is to provide an orientation to all Board and Commission members involved (even those not being proposed for change) to spell out their role specific to the ordinance which created them and make sure everyone is on the same page with their roles and responsibilities.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, asked if the board and commission legislation is on the Consent Agenda and Dennis Murray some are while others are not. Sharon Johnson said she serves on two committees and does not know how the city is going to reorganize and sometimes the city cannot find people to volunteer. It looks like a lot of members are being replaced with professional people while removing residents from the boards and does not know where she stands and if she will be fired from them.

Geoff Oglesby, 618 Washington Street, said his family has had an integral part in the Human Relations Commission. When we look at these types of organizations, we need to look at the mischief which created them. We are in a situation where an organization was started because of racial and gender discrimination and people need to come to the HRC, we do not necessarily

need to go to them. The HRC needs to upgrade and have enforcement power, subpoena power and have teeth put into it, not dilute it. Geoff Oglesby said he too has looked at other cities which do have subpoena and enforcement powers and we need to send a strong message to the community and to the nation discrimination will not be tolerated in the City of Sandusky. When this is changed, the commissioners may want to talk to the community before so they can help.

Dan Leavell, 2106 Mills Street, thanked each of the commissioners for allowing him to serve on the HRC and it has been interesting. The HRC can be strengthened to make it more viable for the community and if the religious community had been interested, there have been openings and they could have applied. Dan Leavell said one member being required to be "Clergy" and another from a "non-profit" agency would serve the same purpose as having two leaving more of an opening for members at large. The proposed legislation outlines how the HRC is to deal with complaints of discriminatory practices and asked how this can be done since currently, the HRC has no investigatory powers because of the union affiliation. In 2012, duties of members of the HRC included investigating through its own initiatives as a result of complaints received about discriminatory practices with policies and procedures in community relations functions. This was also in the revision to the legislation in 2012 but this is not mentioned in the revision before the commission this evening.

Pastor Jeff Sherman, 1212 Butler Street, said he is representing the young people in the community and was not aware the city had a Youth commission and agrees if it has not met, something needs to be done and asked what replaces it. Rebuilding and refurbishing parks and cleaning them up is great, but we have to get to the heart of the issue of our young people who do not have fathers in their homes and getting them involved with programs and organizations geared toward them. There are mothers strung out on drugs, children who are being abused and these are the issues he is working with in the community as a Pastor. Pastor Sherman said he wants to be on board and work with the city to get done to the core of these problems to see what we can do to get to the root of the problems some of our young people are facing. Hopefully this commission can be replaced with something that is effective and will make himself available to be part of the planning and be the voice for young people.

Vicki Bird, 2114 Wilbert Street, said she is a member of the Intelligence Report magazine and the Southern Poverty Law Center, Amnesty International, the Americans United for the Separation of Church, the NAACP, an organization called In These Times and the ACLU which produces a great magazine called "The Stand". To some degree church and state need to be separated but was not aware the city had an HRC nor does she know what it does. She has been paying attention to what is going on in the world and knows what it's like going from a Catholic school system into a public school system with a sense of culture shock. Vicki Bird said she has multi-racial grandchildren and we are all multi-racial and is reading "Democracy In Black. The city should not get rid of an organization where people come together to talk because we need it. Vicki Bird said she carries no hate for anyone and God created us all equal and lives by the word of our Lord and the Constitution of the United States of America and we are all free men and women. Our children in Sandusky are the absolute most important thing.

Daryl Murphy, 1642 N. Larchmont Drive, said he serves as First Vice President of the Sandusky Unit of the NAACP and is currently the Acting President. Knowledge is power and after speaking with Commissioner Twine, Lockhart and Poole and listening, communication is key and we have to communicate before getting ready to make changes. Things get started very quickly in a small community and recommends getting other organizations involved as well as community members to talk about before taking action. The name of the HRC may change but understands this will not happen today. The commission should have representation from the NAACP at the forefront for community relations between the Police force and our citizens. Daryl Murphy said he should have been in the forefront with the HRC and giving input and wants to stand up and do this along with others in the community. We are all members of the human race and Sandusky is just one incident away of things going sour. We have been fortunate with our relations between the Police Department, but it only takes one incident and this is when the HRC will be very

important. The community will be able to go to them to know why this happened and what is being done about it. When the Police are done with an investigation, the HRC should be brought in, told the results of the investigation and provide their input into it and hopes these types of changes will be added into the legislation to give it teeth. It is important for a non-partisan organization to have some input into this. The membership should be a number of people from the community and not necessarily a member of the clergy and we should revisit this. With social media, it does not take long for information to get out and it is very important to deal with facts, not alternative facts. This is a great community and we have to work together and not leave people out; these are the people the NAACP represents.

Monica Hall, 813 Perry Street, said she is here regarding the Sandusky Youth Commission. She was a member of Curtain Call which met in different churches when she was young and created a production at the State Theatre. The finale was all of these kids coming together onstage to sing "We are a Family" and this is what she wants to see in her city. Monica Hall said she coaches the girls' Junior Varsity Basketball team and learns of their backgrounds to help by being a psychiatrist, a psychologist, a mother, a sister, a friend or a confidante. They tell her there is nothing for them to do or nowhere for them to go outside of the schools' structure. An idle mind is the devil's workshop and asked what we are doing for our kids. Monica Hall said she apologizes for not knowing there was a Youth Commission because if she had, perhaps she would have addressed this a long time ago. The Youth Commission could be a catalyst to open doors for our city's youth; it could serve and provide adequate resources including, but not limited to sports and recreation, social and life skills, life training, cultural awareness and tolerance, civil pride and engagement and so much more to make them productive citizens. Monica Hall said she looked at a Youth Commission from Baltimore and they stand for education, public safety, health and recreation and job and economics. We want to teach our kids to be better people and they need other things to do besides sports and need to give them somewhere to go to come together and learn different things and give them a chance to get out of the streets. The Youth Commission should not be repealed, rather it should be given another name and/or another structure and she is going to be part of it.

Jennifer Washington, 1652 South Larchmont Drive, said she has served as the Chairperson of the HRC for the past two years. It is wonderful to see all of the people here but wishes the members of the HRC would see people at their meetings. There are 44 city boards and commissions, some which have never met. The City Commissioners can only do so much and they do not all have people who have volunteered. Jennifer Washington said she hates the "Facebook Newspaper" because of everything written about the City Commission which it never said. If someone puts information about Sandusky, they should get the facts right as everything was all backward. The only way Sandusky will survive is for people to find out what is happening and we are just complaining. There are a lot of wonderful things happening in Sandusky and the Commissioners are doing a wonderful job and we all need to get onboard. We are blessed to not be like Cincinnati and Cleveland with kids getting shot in the streets but we all have to step up to the plate. The HRC or the CRC, whatever it is to be, is starting out fresh with all new members and she will reapply because she loves her city. Jennifer Washington said she graduated from High School in 1965 and celebrated her 50th Class Reunion which makes her old and sometimes things need to change. Fortunately, we are blessed to have so many millennials taking over our city is happy to see new buildings and people who are investing in our city. It is not everyone else's responsibility to make Sandusky a better place; it is **our** responsibility. Anyone is welcome to come to an HRC meeting; in reality, in two years, three persons came before this board to voice a complaint. Jennifer Washington said she goes to events and passes out flyers to make this known, but can only do so much and is with revamping this. People know now there are a lot of boards and commissions and need to get an application to volunteer.

Bev Newell-Hancock, 1427 Marlboro Street, said she has been a member of the HRC for a number of years and they have done a whole lot of nothing. Prior to being on the HRC, she was not even aware it existed and this is part of the problem. The revamping is something she has problems with because what little teeth the HRC does have is being stripped and is being done strategically

and very purposefully. When the Stockett incident took place, Commissioners Twine, Murray and City Manager Wobser suggested the HRC but this was the last involvement the HRC had in this particular event. The decisions were made without consultation with the members and if it is going to be window dressing, we do not need it. If it is going to be a committee, it needs some teeth. Citizens need to have a committee which exists to complain to and like Maya Angelou said, “When people show you who they are, believe them”. Bev Newell-Hancock said when she has been lied to, she is less likely to believe and this is how she feels about the City Commission, they lied.

Blake Harris, 1125 Hollyrood, said he is here to speak on behalf of the younger generation and said there are younger people who care about this community and also are taking action. Blake Harris said he works with Cornelius Hall whose father is a Pastor and is station in Idaho in the U.S. Air Force. He was recruited with Jordan Evans and Spencer Patterson to for a non-profit organization called No Opportunity is Wasted (NOW). Their mission is to provide youth and young adults with the resources to become successful leaders and entrepreneurs to increase innovative concepts, economic empowerment and small business ventures within our local community. Their vision will be to establish this corporation and 501-C-3 status to host youth and young adult leadership and entrepreneurship conferences for our community, develop a state of the art facility designed to assist youth and young adults with creative processes, business plans, start-up capital, management skills and marketing strategies, financial literacy and others. Blake Harris said he is a local business owner of Ohio Drywall but as a unit, NOW will offer diverse backgrounds from its leaders who share the same common goal to give back to our youth and work to inspire other youth. There is a way out and there is opportunity in our own back yard. Blake Harris said he would love to get more involved and realizes he needs to stop making excuses in order to play an integral part in making change.

CURRENT BUSINESS

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to accept all communications. The President declared the motion passed.

CONSENT AGENDA

A. Submitted by Justin Harris

AMENDMENTS TO MAKEUP OF CITY BOARDS & COMMISSIONS

Budgetary Information: There is no impact to the general fund.

- I. **ORDINANCE NO. 17-028:** It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part One (Administrative Code), Title Seven (Boards and Commissions), Chapter 181 (Audit/Finance Committee), Section 181.01 (creation; members) of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.
- II. **ORDINANCE NO. 17-029:** It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part Eleven (Planning and Zoning Code), Title One (Zoning Administration), Chapter 1111 (Board of Zoning Appeals), Section 1111.01 (Organization and Procedure), of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.
- III. **RESOLUTION NO. 013-17R:** It is requested a resolution be passed authorizing the elimination of the Downtown Parking Committee; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.
- IV. **ORDINANCE NO. 17-030:** It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part Thirteen (Building Code), Title One (Building Administration), Chapter 1313 (Electrician Examining Board), of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.
- V. **ORDINANCE NO. 17-031:** It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part Fifteen (Fire Prevention Code), Chapter 1501 (Ohio Fire Code), Section 1501.07 (Fire Prevention Board of

- Appeals), of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.
- VI. [ORDINANCE NO. 17-032](#): It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part Thirteen (Building Code), Title One (Building Administration), Chapter 1315 (Plumber Examining Board) of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.
- VII. [ORDINANCE NO. 17-033](#): It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part Thirteen (Building Code), Title One (Building Administration), Chapter 1309 (Residential Building Code Board of Appeals), Section 1309.01 (Establishment; Members; Procedures), of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.
- VIII. [RESOLUTION NO. 014-17R](#): It is requested a resolution be passed authorizing the elimination of the Enterprise Zone Tax Abatement Negotiating Board and the Tax Incentive Negotiating Committee; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.

B. Submitted by Dave Degnan, Fire Chief

PURCHASE OF SIX SETS OF MORNING PRIDE TAILS TURNOUT GEAR FROM WARREN FIRE EQUIPMENT, INC.

Budgetary Information: The total amount of this expenditure is \$16,758 with each set costing \$2,793. This purchase will be paid with monies from the EMS fund.

[ORDINANCE NO. 17-034](#): It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to purchase six Morning Pride Tails turnout gear, fire coat and pant sets through the State of Ohio, Department of Administrative Services, Cooperative Purchasing program from Warren Fire Equipment, Inc., of Warren, Ohio, for use in the Fire Department; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

C. Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works

CHANGE ORDER #1 – BIWW PAC SYSTEM IMPROVEMENTS FOR ALGAL TOXIN PLANT OPTIMIZATION PROJECT (TIME EXTENSION ONLY)

Budgetary Information: Change Order #1 is for a time extension only. There is no budgetary impact.

[ORDINANCE NO. 17-035](#): It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to approve the first change order for work to be performed by Mosser Construction, Inc., of Fremont, Ohio, for the Big Island Water Works new powder activated carbon system improvements and fluorescence equipment for the algal toxin plant optimization project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

D. Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works

CONSENT TO ODOT FOR COMPLETION OF SYSTEMATIC SIGN REPLACEMENT, FY 2018

Budgetary Information: No funds are required from the city. However, if the city request to add construction items to the project, one hundred percent of those costs would be the responsibility of the city. The city does not anticipate requesting any additional items at this time.

[RESOLUTION NO. 015-17R](#): It is requested a resolution be passed adopting the consent legislation submitted by the Director of the Ohio Department of Transportation for their D03 systematic sign replacement FY 2018 project, PID #98519; authorizing and directing the City Manager to sign the consent legislation and to execute any necessary contracts with the Director of Transportation to complete the project; and declaring that this resolution shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

E. Submitted by Kelly Kresser, City Commission Clerk

ANNUAL CODIFICATION WITH WALTER H. DRANE COMPANY

Budgetary Information: The cost of the revisions for the codification supplements and updating the code on the internet for 2016 will be taken from the contractual services line item in the Commission's budget (50%), sewer funds (25%), and water funds (25%). This item is appropriated each year.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-036: It is requested an ordinance be passed approving current replacement pages to the Sandusky Codified Ordinances for the period of January 1, 2016 through December 31, 2016; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

F. Submitted by Brad Link, Public Service Director

REFUSE/RECYCLING COLLECTION FOR CITY PROPERTY

Budgetary Information: The cost of refuse and recycling pickup and disposal is paid through the general fund, recreation fund and water fund based on the usage (number of pickups per week and the container size). It is recommended the city enter into a two-year agreement for a total not to exceed \$89,466.51.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-037: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a contract with Republic Services of Sandusky, Ohio, for refuse/recycling collection on city property for the period of March 1, 2017 through February 28, 2019; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

G. Submitted by Victoria Kurt, Recreation Superintendent

AMENDMENT TO ORDINANCE FOR ERIE BLACKTOP FIELD FENCE REPLACEMENT PROJECT

Budgetary Information: The quoted cost of the project is \$19,193 and will be paid with the monetary donation received from Erie Blacktop and the monetary donations raised from Leadership Erie County Class of 2016 totaling \$17,212.02, Mylander Foundation – Citizens Wealth Management donation account totaling \$1,763, and the Recreation account totaling \$217.98.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-038: It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Ordinance #17-024 passed on February 13, 2017, expending funds for the purchase and installation of fencing for the Erie Blacktop Field fence replacement project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

H. Submitted by Aaron Klein, Public Works Director

CONTRACT WITH REPUBLIC SERVICES FOR 2017 YARD WASTE COLLECTION SERVICES

Budgetary Information: Based on service for one day per week pickup at \$10.80 per home, per month, and a contract for nine months, the estimated amount for the 2017 yard waste collection service is \$62,694 based on last year's figure of 645 customers. This amount is subject to change due to additions and deletions of customers to the program. The cost of the service will be charged back to the customers in addition to a charge of \$.50 per month for administrative costs.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-039: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a contract with Browning Ferris Industries of Ohio, Inc., dba Republic Waste Services of Sandusky, Ohio, for the 2017 yard waste collection service which is available for the period of April 1, 2017 through December 31, 2017; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

The President asked if anyone wished to remove any of the Consent Agenda Items. Wes Poole requested legislation concerning the ADA Advisory Board, Fair Housing Board, Administrative Benefits Review Committee and Sandusky Youth Commission be read under Regular Agenda items (Renumbered Items 1E, 1F and 1G below).

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to accept the Consent Agenda – with the exception of those noted above - and declare all ordinances and/or resolutions as drafted and presented to the City Commission under the Consent Agenda shall take effect in accordance with the Section reflected in the ordinances and/or resolutions, whether it be in accordance with Section 13 or Section 14 of the City Charter.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinances and resolutions: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinances and resolutions contained in the Consent Agenda passed in accordance with the City Charter.

**ITEM #1 – Submitted by Justin Harris, Law Director
AMENDMENT TO MAKEUP OF AND COMMISSIONS**

Budgetary Information: There is no impact to the General Fund.

- a) **ORDINANCE NO. 17-040:** It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Section 4 of Ordinance No. 02-155 establishing the Bayfront Corridor Committee, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance in full accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter. This motion was later amended by Dick Brady and seconded by Dave Waddington to amend the motion to eventually reduce the membership to 10 through attrition.

Discussion: Wes Poole said the membership of all of the committees have been adjusted except for this one and proposes reducing membership further to either ten or five members. Justin Harris said at one time, this Committee had upwards of 27 members without any terms so it is being proposed to cap the membership to 15 so membership does not continue to increase and terms are not a “life sentence”. Dennis Murray said it is generally not his desire to ask anyone to leave any boards or commissions and it is very valuable to have people who want to serve on boards and commissions. If there are 15 active members who are passionate, he does not really want to kick any of them off. Wes Poole said he does not think of it this way and committees exist for a purpose and recognizes the reasons for keeping all of the current members should apply to every committee the city has. The BCC does not always draw its 15 members nor does it require 15 people. The meetings are open to the public to provide advice and should be of a manageable size ensuring diverse opinions and when there is redundancy around the room with people’s opinions, it is just a mob talking. Dick Brady asked to consider a compromise such as allowing the number to stay at 15 and gradually move down to an acceptable number such as ten, through attrition. Wes Poole said this is fine with him. Dick Brady suggested amending the legislation to reduce the membership from 15 members to ten and to get to this number through attrition. Dick Brady said the membership can be reduced to ten either as board members choose to come off. Justin Harris said terms have also been suggested in the legislation and these will need to be adjusted so attrition can be met in this way as well.

Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to amend the motion to amend the legislation, as written, to reduce the number of members of the Bayfront Corridor Committee from fifteen (15) to ten (10) members through attrition.

Roll call on the motion to amend: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed, as amended. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.

- b) **ORDINANCE NO. 17-041:** It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part One (Administrative Code), Title Seven (Boards and Commissions), by the addition of new Chapter 187 (Economic Development Incentive Committee), of the Codified Ordinances, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance in full accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Wes Poole said he is not in favor of combining these boards. The Revolving Loan Fund (RLF) Committee has a function which is completely different from the Economic Development Incentive Committee (EDI). Historically, the EDI serve the purpose of giving money away to businesses with the intent of fostering development in the community which is a risk. The RLF Committee should be a little bit tighter as to who we provide loans to so the city gets its money back. This can best be accomplished with a different group of people. Wes Poole said he would also like to have different community members involved in all of our boards and commissions and this will help to accomplish it. We need to do a good job of selecting people for the committee which wants to accomplish specific goals and people have to change hats between committees. Nikki Lloyd said combining these Committees creates a lot of efficiency to depend on staff in the Development Department. The EDI committee can be creative and put packages together for new or existing business owners and can figure out the best way to help them sustain, improve or start their business. Not combining these committees merely makes one more meeting staff has to go to and one more level of confusion for a business owner. Dennis Murray said some very fine folks serve on the RLF Committee and there are strict procedures in place to receive this money. The nature of these loans are such that other lenders are unable to provide although there have been some mistakes made in the past which we are in the process of doing. Wes Poole said it is not necessarily a burden for the staff to meet separately or simply extend the meeting they are already in to go over loan requests. This is not a duplication of effort and the more eyes and involvement on decisions of how city money is spent will provide more support and trust from the community.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd and Dave Waddington, 6. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.

- c) **PASSED AT FIRST READING:** It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part One (Administrative Code), Title Seven (Boards and Commissions), Chapter 157 (Human Relations Commission) of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under first reading.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under first reading.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart said he is trying to consume everything which has been said with regard to the HRC and the community is not completely connected to this issue. When the city does things, they should not do them without consent of the people and it seems people have been serving on the HRC, but we have not really consented with them nor have we gotten their feedback. Staff has gone out of their way to propose these changes without vetting them and does not see how the commission can move forward with these changes. Having a non-profit member of the HRC mandated and having two members of the clergy does not seem to mesh with reality although it is a good idea. Members of the clergy or non-profit representatives can join at any time and we should not mandate one member being part of this. We should make this inclusive, with preferences for people of different backgrounds, but we should not make it mandatory. Some people have suggested the HRC have investigative power or authority and have seen them set up both ways. An investigation for subpoena is not necessarily a bad thing, it is simply a formal question and a way to arrive at a recommendation. Greg Lockhart said if members of the Police Department are part of an investigation, he trusts them enough to be trust with a subpoena and how to handle it to allow the HRC to do the work they should do. This committee is about human relations for everyone and is here to serve as a guide to what we do as a city for everyone and having investigative powers is probably an important thing to look at in the future. Some members

of the HRC who are here do not agree with this while others did not even realize we had a HRC and this in and of itself is indicative of a problem. Naomi Twine said under 157.02D and E of the proposed amendment, investigations are included. As far as the suggestion about identifying seats for certain individuals (clergy, non-profit persons), we need to take into account the diversity of the community and allowing opportunities for diversity. Wes Poole suggested in regard to diversity, this is represented on 43 other committees of the city. The HRC exists to provide a place for segments of the community not being treated fairly or equally (or perceived so) and it is necessary. Changing the name to Community Relations Committee waters this down. This movement is a step in the wrong direction and black lives actually matter, it is as simple as that. For the commission to decide the committee is not formed the way they want it to be and do away with it in this fashion is inappropriate. Wes Poole suggested the reason the HRC exists is to provide a voice for those who are under-served and may not always be African American in terms of the problems happening throughout the country and historically what we have seen in Sandusky. We do not have any major problems, but for those who do, they need a comfortable place to go. If members of the clergy had an interest in serving, they would have already asked to be on it. We are trying to build a community in which we all get along and it is necessary to say things that might be rather raw. Assigning one's favorite clergyman who may not be as committed or as knowledgeable about issues of race is generic and probably not the direction we want to go. There will be times things will come up in the community which are unpleasant in dealing with race and we need a place to take them with people committed to solving it, not folks looking for a way to make it palatable to the community. Wes Poole suggested voting this down and asking staff to get back with the HRC members and come up with a new format which is workable. We can get into details such as subpoenas later, but does not think the community needs to go this far, but we should have the discussion so everyone is committed to working together and providing a place where everyone is comfortable living here. Naomi Twine said she believes this is open to all and we should not be questioning whether clergy would be interested. This is being voted upon at first reading and there is still time for comment and she is still open for comment on the issue. Greg Lockhart said with regard to clergy, we should be inclusive of all people, all faiths and backgrounds, but when choosing only two clergy members, other religions are left out. If two non-profits are chosen, others are left out and we should never be in a position to exclude people and this should be open to anyone who wishes to join. We should look at quality and fairness, not exclusivity. Greg Lockhart said we have to look at being inclusive, not exclusive. This is the HRC, yet we left out the human part of it and those here tonight had no part in the process. These are volunteer boards and we are daring to push them out and he will not do this so long as he is a commissioner. Nikki Lloyd said she does not see this as trying to exclude anyone and creating a CRC versus HRC will include everyone. Persons from every single religion, ethnicity and walk of life can still show up to meetings and voice their opinions and we need the community to come together. There are some wonderful non-profit organizations in the community who may not be as influential or have the backing to assist on this commission and some things are being taken too extreme. Nikki Lloyd said she hopes every person who showed up today comes to the HRC meetings because everyone is welcome. She has heard this is not a white or a black thing, it is a human thing and everyone needs to continue to show up and be included and let the HRC help people. We are trying to have some efficiency with all of the decision being made tonight to take care of our community. Wes Poole asked what being on the board of a non-profit organization has to do with being able to address issues brought before the HRC. Nikki Lloyd said there are some non-profit organizations which can provide a lot of support which can provide funding and help take care of matters. One person with not a lot of connections may not be able to help but can as a group and with the support of those who show up to meetings. Wes Poole said the HRC makes decisions about discrimination or mistreatment people receive; they are not buying anything so a donation from a non-profit will not bring wisdom, fairness or understanding for those under-served. It seems as if people have someone in mind from a non-profit and saying someone who is not affiliated with one has nothing to offer. Naomi Twine said the reason for having a person from a non-profit organization, as an example, would be the Director of the CAC who might be connected with various people from the community seeking needs. Their connection to people seeking needs gives them a level of empathy about the issues and concerns from what people may be experiencing. This could possibly also be someone from the NAACP as

they deal with minority issues and having someone from a non-profit entity serving on the CRC would bring people to the table with experiences and connections as well as be empathetic and sympathetic to issues and concerns. Greg Lockhart said individuals from non-profits can bring good valuable experience to the Commission, but this is an individual. An individual who was a product of slavery or one who was discriminated against and beaten or a woman passed over for a job has a lot of experience, but an organization does not; people bring experience. Dennis Murray said there is a lot of passion about this particular piece of legislation and how it is the members should be appointed and hopes between now and the next meeting, specific amendments can be offered as to how it might be approved. Wes Poole said empathy is not assigned by a job description and it is possible to get people from any number of non-profits who have empathy but it is just as likely they do not have empathy on a specific topic. Limiting this to just them is a mistake, likewise with clergy members. Dick Brady said the objection to the legislation is based upon the makeup of the committee and asked if there might be some middle ground. Wes Poole said that is only a piece of this. Greg Lockhart said this about the by-laws and how this came about without consent of the people here. We should hear from them and then come up with our compromise, decisions, by-laws and determination about who should be on the committee. These are volunteers without the consent of the volunteers' experience who have been on the HRC. Nikki Lloyd asked if this can be adjusted from what has been said here tonight and Justin Harris said this is indeed the purpose of having a second reading. We can continue to listen and possibly make changes for the next vote. Wes Poole said the makeup of the committee is troublesome and it got this way to change its purpose and the commission should be thinking about this for the next two weeks. This has been watered down so as not to address what the community expects it to do what it exists for. Its purpose is to address concerns of a segment of the community which is sometimes under-served or mistreated at times. It is offensive to do away with this avenue for these folks by restructuring the membership. Wes Poole said these folks got on people's nerves and brought up things people did not want to hear about and now we are just going to delete what they are able to accomplish. Naomi Twine said we are not eliminating anything and this is inaccurate.

Upon motion of Greg Lockhart and second of Wes Poole, the commission voted to table this legislation. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. Nays: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd and Dave Waddington, 5. The President declared this motion failed.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 6. Nays: Greg Lockhart, 1. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd and Dave Waddington, 5. Nays: Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the legislation passed at first reading.

d) ORDINANCE FAILED: It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part One (Administrative Code), Title Seven (Boards and Commissions), Chapter 161 (Planning Commission), and Part Eleven (Planning and Zoning Code), Title Five (Additional Zoning Requirements), Chapter 1161 (Landmark Preservation), Section 1161.03 (Establishment of Landmark Commission) of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance shall take effect under suspension of the rules as contained in and in accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance in full accordance with Section 13 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Nikki Lloyd said she does not completely support this although she would be willing to try it. This may create an issue if the National Historic District is approved where people making renovations to properties will have to wait for a long period of time for approval. Currently, the Downtown Design Review Committee can meet as needed whereas the Landmark

Commission only meets once each month. The Planning Commission members are not educated in the design review guidelines for the city or for the National Historic Review. Dennis Murray said his understand is currently, members of the Planning Commission are also members of the Landmark Commission and one meets first and then the meeting is closed and the next begins. Angela Byington said this is accurate and members of the Planning Commission are on the Landmark Commission. Any property on the National Register either individually or listed within a district goes the Landmark Commission for exterior renovations. The Design Review Committee currently reviews properties within the design review district. When properties overlap and there is a historic property within the design review district, it would go to the Landmark Commission. In the future, there will be a larger amount of properties which will fall within the historic district if the expansion goes through. Wes Poole said he also has concerns about this and the Planning Commission was established to cover this as the Landmark Commission until we found people with the expertise and interest in landmark buildings. Combining this into one committee does not save anything other than the thirty seconds it takes for the Planning Commission to close one meeting and open the next one. Separate minutes are already taken and for purposes of not confusing the community, we are better off with two separate committees. This will involve more people from the community and the more interest, the better we are. All of these recommendations come from a perspective of effectiveness and efficiency and the staff much of the time has to support these committees. There is a tendency to see this as a good idea to combine committees and do other little things to shave a little bit off the edges. The other perspective is as an elected representative, he is looking at it may take a little more work on our part, but how are we best represented. It was intended for the Landmark Committee to be separate from the Planning Commission and it does take specific expertise and passion when dealing with old buildings and making sure people are kept on task. Adding this load long-term to the volunteers on the Planning Commission is a recipe for disaster and this needs to be separated and we need to spread the workload. Justin Harris said this is a perfect example of why this legislation was presented under Section 13 for debate. Staff also has reservations based upon discussions which took place today with the Historical Society in Columbus but wanted to gauge the commissions' position because the Planning Commission has been functioning as the Landmark Commission for some time now. Staff would not be offended one bit if the commission requested these be separated and is the reason for this process. The proposed amendment gave the Planning Commission the responsibilities of the Landmark Commission since they have already been functioning in this capacity. One of the concerns expressed today by the Historical Society was addressed here tonight. Nikki Lloyd said having more people involved does create a lot of passion within the city but said we have worked very hard over the last couple of years to rebuild the Downtown Design Review Committee to ensure the people who sit on it have done research about the city's guidelines and those of the National Historic Preservation Office. Nikki Lloyd asked if these two committees could possibly be combined. Wes Poole said these are separate decisions and there should be separate commissions and does not see the efficiency in combining them as one still has to be adjourned for the next to meet. Wes Poole said if he was comfortable with those on the Downtown Design Review Committee, he might be comfortable with them being on the Landmark Committee. This would not do away with the concerns made by the State. Justin Harris said they expressed the Landmark Commission should be a stand-alone commission.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 6. Nays: Greg Lockhart, 1. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Nays: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance failed.

e) PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part One (Administrative Code), Title Seven (Boards and Commissions), Chapter 155 (Fair Housing Board) and Chapter 159 (ADA Advisory Board) of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance be passed under first reading.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading.

Discussion: Wes Poole asked if it is required for the city to have a Fair Housing Board and Justin Harris said it does, by law. This must be in place with respect to fair housing complaints although we have not received any in quite some time. Wes Poole said the ADA Advisory Board serves a good purpose, represents an underrepresented segment of the community and goes back since the federal law was passed which the city did not follow very well. These board should not be combined; the members of the ADA Board are passionate about what they do and have a specific purpose and fair housing has no relationship to this whatsoever. The city should appoint a Fair Housing Board and if it is seldom used, it will just be on the books. Member of the ADA Advisory Board would have no interest or knowledge in fair housing.

Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd Poole and Dave Waddington, 6. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

- f) **PASSED AT FIRST READING:** It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part One (Administrative Code), Title Five (Officers and Departments), Chapter 145 (Employee Provisions), Section 145.05 (b) (Monthly salary ranges for administrative, confidential, management, supervisory, judicial and professional), of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky, in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow; and declaring that this ordinance be passed under first reading.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under first reading, as amended to include one additional City Commissioner (chosen by the Commissioners), the Commission President, the City Manager, the Finance Director, the Law Director and the Commission Clerk.

Discussion: Wes Poole asked about the makeup of this committee and what they do. Justin Harris said the Administrative Benefits Review Committee deals with specific raises to administrative employees. The only proposed change is to the language regarding the Charter Officers and Commission President. Based upon the recent Charter change, the Law Director and Finance Director are no longer Charter employees. This amendment was solely presented to clarify the makeup of the committee legally. This committee (Dennis Murray, Hank Solowiej, Justin Harris, Eric Wobser and Kelly Kresser) met to propose the two percent increases for administrative employees according to Section 145.05, but our books should be cleaned up to designate the proper parties including the City Manager, Commission President, Finance Director, Law Director, City Manager and Commission Clerk. Wes Poole said he will vote no on this because although the Finance and Law Directors are no longer Charter Officers, they would be setting their own benefits and it should not be this way as the citizens deserve better. Dennis Murray said this committee has existed for a couple of decades and simply makes recommendations to the City Commission without having any authority. This is simply to clean up the legislation since the Charter Officer positions no longer exist. With rate exception, it only meets once each year. Justin Harris said this committee only provides recommendations for employees not covered by a bargaining unit as there is no one else who would negotiate or ask for raises for the administrative employees. This group meets, discusses and provides a recommendation to the members of the Audit/Finance Committee who then submit it to the City Commission. Even when persons in these positions were Charter Officers, it still affected their salaries. Wes Poole said in the past, the people making these recommendations worked for the City Commission, but they do not anymore and it makes a difference. Appropriately, in protecting the citizens, we should have the City Manager and two or three City Commissioners as they are the ones responsible for the money. Approval is based upon what is provided to the City Commissioners with detail and background and it is provided on the Thursday prior to the meetings. When dealing with their own raises, the City Commission should take a little more interest. Naomi Twine asked if this is a mechanism for those exempt from a bargaining unit and Justin Harris affirmed it is; suggested a couple of City Commissioners should

be on the Committee to discuss raises or lack thereof. This is done at the State level as well to approve raises for non-affiliated employees. Justin Harris said the Finance Director should be included with this group as he is the one who knows how much money is in the bank and how much increases at a specific percent would be. The Law Director is involved as they have obligations with respect to codified responsibilities for administrative employees, not because he is worried about what his raise may or may not be, it is about the other 47 or so employees. Justin Harris said it does make sense to add one or two more commissioners to the committee, but to also include the Finance Director and Law Director. Dennis Murray asked if there is a mechanism as to how these commissioners would be selected. Wes Poole understands what has been said about the Law Director and Finance Director attending and being part of this committee, but there is a difference about restructuring with one City Commissioner as there will still be a three to two vote on their (employees) own benefits. Eric Wobser said there are still two employees who would report to the Commissioners and two who do not and this is not a majority of commission-responsive staff. Wes Poole said he agrees these two employees should be there, but not necessarily as voting members and is being picky about this because when he and others here tonight are gone, the citizens are at the mercy of whatever talent the Commissioners hire. Structurally, this is not set up right. Wes Poole said we continually add substance to a decision by indicating the Audit/Finance Committee members say it is okay and suggests for his purposes, this committee tells the commissioners that money exists in the bank account. This has little to do with whether or not the policy of what we spend it on is appropriate or right; they do not add any credence to spending any money. Dennis Murray said they have a broader responsibility to ensure we have proper procedures in place and supervise the state audit. Wes Poole said in terms of deciding on whether money is spent for specific things, the members of the Audit/Finance Committee saying it is okay has little value to setting priorities.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray and Dave Waddington, 5. Nays: Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the motion passed, as amended. Roll call on the ordinance, as amended: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray and Dave Waddington, 5. Nays: Nikki Lloyd and Wes Poole, 2. The President declared the ordinance passed, as amended, at first reading.

- g) PASSED AT FIRST READING:** It is requested an ordinance be passed repealing Part One (Administrative Code), Title Seven (Boards and Commissions), Chapter 173 (Sandusky Youth Commission) of the Codified Ordinances of the City of Sandusky; and declaring that this ordinance be passed under first reading.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under first reading.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart said in hearing comments from the public tonight regarding the Sandusky Youth Commission, he cannot see eliminating it. This Commission does not impact our budget but it does enhance lives of youth in the community. Before us, we have individuals who are willing to take this up and in looking at its purpose, he cannot see why the city would not give them the opportunity to do so. Wes Poole said as written, he understands this needs to be appealed since it is not functional but would like to hear from the staff about where we go from here to address those who have expressed an interest in helping with a Youth Commission. Eric Wobser said a strong commitment to reach out to and support, nurture and mentor our youth is critically important. Our Neighborhood Outreach Coordinator, Talon Flohr, and Dave Waddington have discussed efforts to engage youth in the city as well as others. There is value of a restated Youth Commission to provide adult guidance with both local school districts participating through mentorship. We do not yet have the details of what this Youth Commission would look like, but our intent is to bring back alternate legislation to oversee such a program. Justin Harris said he recommends, for purposes of clearing our books, to vote to repeal this legislation and make a motion for the City Manager and other staff to meet with interested adults and create a different Youth Commission. This will be taken up under New Business.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed at first reading.

ITEM #2 – Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer

CURBSIDE PLACEMENT OF REFUSE/RECYCLING CONTAINERS

Budgetary Information: There is no budgetary effect on the proposed amendment to Chapter 955 of the City of Sandusky Codified ordinances.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed amending Part Nine (Streets, Utilities and Public Services Code), Title Five (Other Public Services), Chapter 955 (Solid Waste Disposal) Section 955.15 (Limitations on curbside placement) of the codified ordinances of the City of Sandusky in the manner and way specifically set forth hereinbelow.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading.

Discussion: Nikki Lloyd said this is an instance where residents have asked for something and the city is delivering. Matt Lasko said this proposed change will benefit a significant portion of residents in Sandusky and has been asked of us over the past couple of months. We get requests in our Code Enforcement Division and through the *Sandusky Register* and from Serving Our Seniors to adjust the time of curbside placement beginning at 4 p.m. during the months of October through March rather than at 6 p.m. This will help with safety concerns when it is dark at 6 p.m.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under first reading.

ITEM #3 – Submitted by Matt Lasko, Chief Development Officer

PURCHASE & SALE AGREEMENT WITH BORN AGAIN SALVAGE, LLC

Budgetary Information: The city will be responsible for incurring approximately \$150,000 in acquisition related expenses, assuming release of all contingencies to be paid by the capital fund and financed with the city's various purpose note renewal.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-042: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a purchase and sale agreement to purchase the former American Crayon property located at 1706 Hayes Avenue and identified as Parcel #57-01278.000; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Naomi Twine said she will reluctantly vote yes on this legislation. Mr. Gaitan took advantage of the city in allowing him to say he would clean up the property and leave it in such condition. We need to try and get this property cleaned up as soon as possible and does not want to have to look at it anymore days than she has to. Naomi Twine said Mr. Gaitan used the city to get the resources out he wanted and then left the city high and dry. Dave Waddington said this is a health and safety issue and is very unwelcoming for the City of Sandusky. The city took care of the former Esmond Dairy property, a former winery and the former G & C Foundry, but this route has Sandusky High School and one of the top hospitals in Ohio and is not a good welcome. There was not a lot of action taking place here this winter and is a "yes" vote whether

it be turned into greenspace and cut twice each year, it will look better than it does now. Wes Poole said he is not as excited about this as everyone else; the concept of giving Mr. Gaitan \$150,000 for this property with tax delinquencies as there are other ways to get the property. We could work through the Erie County Treasurer's Office and he is not in a rush as this property has been a mess for forty years and another six months would not be a significant issue. Wes Poole said this \$150,000 would be better spent on making the Rockwell Street neighborhood better. If the owner has not paid his properties, we can recoup this money without paying an additional \$150,000 on top of everything else and is not necessary. As long as this property has been this way, folks have talked about it being a safety hazard, a danger to kids and we have absolutely zero instances of problems other than when the building was still up, vagrants were living in it; no one was hurt. The urgency to dip into our coffers for another \$150,000 seems to be a little much. There are eyesores in other places in the community and this one can wait and the money can be better spent. Dennis Murray suggested in the interim to walk the commissioners through the likely scenarios and problems which caused a recommendation to not let this go through the foreclosure process as there is an outstanding order which is litigable issue to tear the building down. Justin Harris said first and foremost with regard to foreclosures is they can take upward to one to two years to resolve. From the standpoint this commission has taken a stance that the former American Crayon is a hazard and safety concern to individuals in the community and regardless of the time it has been deemed as such, we have gone on record stating concerns with the state of the building and the emergency has not dissipated. If we were to go through the foreclosure action and hope we will foreclose based upon delinquent taxes, there is always the equitable right of redemption and until a jury says at trial to order the bill paid or make payment agreement with the Erie County Auditor each month, we would be in the same situation we are in now. We have entered into an agreement with the owner whereby they were supposed to demolish this by a specific period of time. If we were to pursue a breach of contract claim or a temporary restraining order preventing demolition altogether, staff is concerned about this. At one time the city asked Mr. Gaitan what he wanted for this property and he started with a figure of \$2 million and we abruptly ceased to communicate with him in this regard. Matt Lasko has negotiated over an extended period of time to get this number of \$150,000 for him to walk away although we are not doing this willingly. Justin Harris said coming from the private sector, he would have advised any of his private clients that even though this aches in the stomach to pay someone this amount, it actually makes the most business sense from a legal perspective. Matt Lasko said our Erie County Treasurer has been tremendous in pushing properties through the foreclosure process. We also know because they want revenue, there is a very high likelihood with a small amount of pocket change, the owner can enter into a payment plan which would buy him or her 24 months which is unacceptable. Matt Lasko said it has been a blessing this structure has not fallen, but just because it has not does not make it a foregone conclusion that it will not and we do not want to risk this happening. When we speak to nearby residents and the leadership at the Sandusky City Schools, they realize this is a safety concern and is part of the reason there are "For Sale" signs on Rockwell Street and Hayes Avenue across the street. This is something we need to take care of immediately and we have been very aggressive with and taking very seriously. Matt Lasko said it also pains him to pay someone as well but a lot of this money will go to pay the delinquent taxes and mechanic's liens on the property so it is not \$150,000 into Mr. Gaitan's pocket. We also got a recent appraisal for the former G & C Foundry property which is comparably-sized (6 acres) which came in at \$140,000. The Ohio Housing Finance Agency has a neighborhood initiative program to purchase and demolish properties in communities which is beneficial to have and a \$1.1 million grant was provided for the Erie County Land Bank. It is this important to demolish these properties and if we have to line someone's pocket a little bit to get them out of town, it is something we have to do and this is where the recommendation is coming from. Dick Brady said it is painful to have to spend \$150,000 to buy this property and one or two months from now, we will have to vote on spending one half of one million dollars to clean it up. This does not make this any less reasonable to do and does not see how we as a community can preach blight elimination and continue to allow something like this to stand. This does not just affect the city's largest employer, Firelands Regional Medical Center, it affects every child who passes underneath the underpass going back and forth to and from school. It affects every visitor coming into our city and using Hayes Avenue as a main corridor.

Sometimes government has to go down some pretty dark roads and sometimes have to turn around when they get to the end but it is time to cross this bridge, deal with this issue and put it behind us. Dick Brady said he hopes these legacy issues do not outlive him but it does not look good at this point. Wes Poole said he is looking at the best use of our money and asked what the taxes are for this parcel Matt Lasko said the delinquency is \$15,000 but does not know the annual amount; probably between \$5,000 to \$10,000 annually. Wes Poole said we are dealing with an individual who has walked away from a property he has absolutely no use for. This is \$150,000 out of the city's pocket into his and it does not make him (Wes) feel better it will pay the delinquent taxes because it is still the city's money paying the taxes and liens. If there is a payment plan approved, it requires the owner must pay the amount owed, but the next time the taxes are due again, he would be required to pay the full amount owed to keep it current, or would go immediately into the next step which would allow the city to take the property. This would be a four-month wait time to start moving forward on taking the property and suggests offering him a whole lot less. Justin Harris said when there is a tax delinquency at the county level, the Law Director would not be the one to file the foreclosure action, and these are done by the Erie County Prosecutor's Office. People have gone two or three years in delinquency before a foreclosure action is even filed. The Prosecutor has a very strong caseload and the city has no guarantee or control over how fast the county will jump with respect to filing a foreclosure action. It is a city problem even though the county would be handling it and we cannot hold their feet to the fire. Wes Poole said he hopes since Erie County has discretion about what they do that the city can get priority assistance on something this important. Dennis Murray said Mr. Gaitan has left this community with this eyesore and expense and asked why the city cannot go after him and at least get our demolition costs recouped. Justin Harris said corporations are formed to protect personal liability so even though Mr. Gaitan is the problem, he formed an LLC to purchase the property and cannot be held liable individually. The company has no assets and is non-existent and probably would be three or four years before the city could get finality on a foreclosure as the county would spend months simply trying to get service on a statutory agent which probably no longer in existence. Nikki Lloyd said everyone is in agreement no one wants to give Mr. Gaitan one penny, but for what he has done in saying he would demolish this property and did not follow through, we also do not know the stability of the structure. The longer we leave it there, the more dangerous it could become and will vote yes on this and would rather Mr. Gaitan would not come back and visit the city anymore.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd and Dave Waddington, 6. Nays: Wes Poole, 1. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

ITEM #4 – Submitted by Angela Byington, Planning Director

CDBG FY 2016 RESIDENTIAL DEMOLITION PROJECT #2

Budgetary Information: The project cost based on the bid, including advertisement and miscellaneous costs is \$54,170. This project will be paid for with \$43,670 of FY 2016 Community Development Block Grant funds and \$10,500 of insurance fire funds.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-043: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a contract with Ed Burdue & Company, LLC, of Sandusky, Ohio, for the CDBG FY 2016 residential demolition project #2; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter. Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

**ITEM #5 – Submitted by Maria Muratori, Development Specialist
AMENDMENT TO GRANT AGREEMENT WITH DALY'S**

Budgetary Information: The city will be responsible for providing \$31,618.80 (an increase of \$2,353.80) in grant proceeds from the economic development capital projects fund on a reimbursable basis at the completion of the project.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-044: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and approving an amendment to the grant agreement with Daly's, Ltd., in relation to the property located at 104 – 110 Columbus Avenue; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Wes Poole, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Maria Muratori said this is the first time the city has done this and it is somewhat unusual. Daly's experienced an increase in cost due to additional lighting and an upgrade in some of the materials and asked if this could be brought back to the Economic Development Committee (which was approved), and ultimately here tonight.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

**ITEM #6 – Submitted by Marvin Ranaldson, Transit Administrator
SERVICE AGREEMENT WITH FIRST TRANSIT, INC. FOR SANDUSKY TRANSIT SYSTEM**

Budgetary Information: STS operations and administration are funded by the Federal Transit Administration, State of Ohio, local contributing agencies, local contributing private entities, the daily farebox collections and the city's general fund. The city has agreed upon a normalized service per hour rate of \$32.98 for 2017.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-045: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a transportation services agreement between the City of Sandusky and First Transit, Inc. of Cincinnati, Ohio, in relation to the Sandusky Transit System; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Naomi Twine, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Marvin Ranaldson said we began this process in November, 2016, to determine who would be the next service provider for the next three to five years. Through this process, we determined First Transit of Cincinnati would be the best fit for us and will allow us to take more pride in the system. As the STS grows and faces challenges in the future, they will be the best option for us. The RFP was released nationally and locally in November and we received responses from the three largest transit providers in the world. Through the interview process, we narrowed this down to two companies which would be a good fit. In doing a final analysis, the committee determined First Transit would be the best fit for Sandusky not simply based upon price, but truly believe they have the experience and expertise to deliver what they have promised which has been an issue in the past. Dennis Murray said this is a three-year agreement with an option for two consecutive one-year extensions. Greg Lockhart asked how far along we are with making changes for disabled which will require on demand service. Marvin Ranaldson said we are delaying the rollout of Paratransit service until the new service provider is in place. We face other changes and feel it is best to hold off until such time to implement it in the most efficient and effective way.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

ITEM #7 – Submitted by Brad Link, Public Services Director

PURCHASE OF PLAY EQUIPMENT AND SURFACING FOR FOXBOROUGH PARK

Budgetary Information: This purchase in the amount of \$28,084.41 will be paid from the capital projects fund. This project was made possible through Issue 8 funding.

PASSED AT FIRST READING: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to purchase playground equipment and associated surfacing from David Williams & Associates/ Gametime of Alliance, Ohio, for Foxborough Park.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Nikki Lloyd, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance at first reading.

Discussion: Dave Waddington said he is thrilled we are pushing these parks and thanked Brad Link. We are going to be working to get the basketball courts up and running at Orlando Pace Park and removing rocks and installing new equipment at Lions Park. Greg Lockhart said it is excellent we are getting another park in neighborhoods for kids to play on as they make memories for kids. Greg Lockhart said we should pay more attention to the basketball court as there are a lot of half courts and it is good to play a good game of basketball. Going forward, would like to see completing courts and bring this activity back for our kids. Wes Poole said before we do anymore basketball courts, we need to have a thorough conversation about how to provide them, and where and at what level across the city. Brad Link said the basketball court at Orlando Pace Park will be an official full-sized, college basketball court.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed under first reading.

ITEM #8 – Submitted by Brad Link, Public Services Director

TREE REMOVAL & TRIM PROJECT FOR 2017

Budgetary Information: The cost of the project is \$71,868.04 and will be paid from the capital projects fund. This project was made possible through Issue 8 funding.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-046: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to enter into a contract with Tree Experts of Huron, Ohio, for the 2017 tree removal and trim project; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Dennis Murray said this is to remove 68 dead trees and trim 41 boulevard trees. Wes Poole said this is not nearly enough trees and we are not getting enough done in the season, but he will approve this. Brad Link said this is the 2017 tree list for trimming and removal; this does not include work being done in-house by city staff. To this point in the year, we have taken ten trees down and are trimming and removing in-house as much as we are able with two full-time staffers and assistance from other divisions. Eric Wobser said in the budget approved by the Finance Committee scheduled for commission approval on March 13, the addition of one full-time employee is included along with one seasonal employee in the Forestry Division. This will create two internal crews throughout the warmer weather months. Greg Lockhart said as liaison

to the Tree Commission, it is not a matter of the city not caring about taking care of trees, it is a matter of manpower and labor. We will increase the manpower this year and would also like to see more trees removed but recognizes some are going down every day. It is labor intensive and trees must be removed in a safe manner and it takes a little more time to do it the right way.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

ITEM #9 – Submitted by Aaron Klein, Director of Public Works

CHANGE ORDER #2 FOR BIWW EMERGENCY INTAKE REHAB & CHEMICAL FEED LINE INSTALLATION PROJECT

Budgetary Information: The original contract with Hank's Plumbing & Heating Co., Inc. is for \$435,995 and Change Order #1 increased the contract to \$443,481.56. Change Order #2 and final, for an additional amount of \$13,712.30 will revise the contract amount to \$457,193.86. The project is fully funded through the water fund.

ORDINANCE NO. 17-047: It is requested an ordinance be passed authorizing and directing the City Manager to approve the second change order for work being performed by Hank's Plumbing & Heating Co., Inc. of Toledo, Ohio, for the Big Island Water Works emergency intake rehabilitation and chemical feed line installation project in the amount of \$13,712.30; and declaring that this ordinance shall take immediate effect in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Wes Poole, the Commission voted to approve this ordinance under suspension of the rules and in full accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

Discussion: Aaron Klein said this is the final change order for this project and these two items relate to safety. Because the project is located within the nature preserve at BIWW, we wanted to ensure safety is a high priority. We will place handrails around the intake and will be backfilling between the new wall and the intake itself so there is not a gap. This area is used by people fishing.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the motion passed. Roll call on the ordinance: Yeas: Dick Brady, Naomi Twine, Greg Lockhart, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd, Wes Poole and Dave Waddington, 7. The President declared the ordinance passed in accordance with Section 14 of the City Charter.

CITY MANAGER'S REPORT

- **Upon motion of Naomi Twine and second of Wes Poole, the commission voted to accept a donation in the amount of \$200 for the K9 Fund from the Sandusky Rotary Club Charitable Fund. The President declared the motion passed.**
- **Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to allow submission of a grant to the Wightman-Wieber Foundation to pay for Police Officers to perform bicycle patrol assignments in 2017.**

Discussion: Eric Wobser asked the Commission for verbal approval to submit this grant to as due to time constraints for filing, a communication will follow at the next meeting.

The President declared the motion passed.

- The **State of the City address will be held on Thursday, March 16 at 12 p.m. at Castaway Bay** and the cost will be \$12.50 per person for non-Rotary members.
- The original appointment testing for Police Officers and Fire Fighters will be conducted by the National Testing Network. Information for the testing process can be found on the city's website and the National Testing Network website. Open testing dates are from February 20 through April 8. For questions, contact Deb Leslie at 419.627.5885 or Eva Olcott at 419.627.5870.
- **Upon motion of Dick Brady and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to schedule a Public Hearing regarding the 2017 Budget and appropriations ordinance on March 13.**

Discussion: Eric Wobser said the appropriations ordinance will be on the City Commission Agenda for the March 13 and March 27 City Commission meetings and requests a public hearing be set for the March 13 meeting.

The President declared the motion passed.

- Mills Creek Golf Course will open Monday, March 6 for the 2017 season.
- A Special **Planning Commission Meeting has been scheduled for March 8 to discuss Transient Rental**, as it pertains to the Zoning Code.
- The Division of Code Enforcement is excited to welcome Jahn Farris as the new Code Compliance Officer who begins employment on Tuesday February 28.

OLD BUSINESS

Dave Waddington thanked Hank Solowiej and members of the Audit/Finance Committee for their reporting and said in the past, he recalls many late night meetings with the city's budget. This report is easy to read and will save a lot of time. We have a lot of competent people on this committee.

Greg Lockhart said he, Maria Muratori and Matt Lasko hosted a forum for the Housing & Development program and there was a good showing and people were very happy about it. Greg Lockhart said he would like to recognize excellence in our staff for taking the time to do this because this could have been time spent with their families. They time and time again come after working hours and work above and beyond what they are called to do and has never heard them complain.

Dennis Murray said at the last commission meeting, the **Fire Chief Selection Board** was announced and since this time, he understands Greg Lockhart is interested in serving as his designee since he is liaison to the Fire Department. Greg Lockhart will be serving in this capacity on the Fire Chief Selection Board.

NEW BUSINESS

Wes Poole said he had requested the Police Chief provide information specific to a traffic study on West Monroe Street and is looking for feedback from members of the community. This would be from Tiffin Avenue to Edgewater Drive where currently, the speed limit is 35 miles per hour. Complaints have been received about the narrowness of the street and the speed of traffic and vehicles (mirrors) have been hit. As we move forward with the Lions Park project and moving bicyclists through this area, we can perhaps consider lowering the speed limit to 25 miles per hour.

Upon motion of Wes Poole and second of Greg Lockhart Poole, the commission voted to direct the City Manager, through the Law Department, to get the commission the necessary information about whether we can legally do this, or not.

Discussion: Greg Lockhart said in an effort to get the city's message out to the public, he has spoken to the city's IT Department and believes the commission meetings should be broadcast live on Facebook if we have the capacity. This will not affect the city's budget, but it gets us out in front of the public to more people in the community. We are in an iPad and MP3 generation, but we are sending our message out on an eight-track tape in some sense. Justin Harris said he would like additional time to coordinate with our IT staff regarding the legalities of this on a medium such as Facebook live. Greg Lockhart said we can move forward with the idea and understands there may be legal issues or technical issues to work through. Dave Waddington said this meeting is already broadcast on Cable television and is also available 24/7 on www.YouTube.com and does not see the extra cost involved. Wes Poole said we are already off the air and if we were on Facebook live we would not be. The cost is non-existent. Wes Poole said he is not on Facebook but everyone he knows is and recognizes it is a good thing to get more people to know what we are doing and realizes he could be on it if he turned it on his phone. Our IT Department can determine what the best way would be to provide this. Greg Lockhart said we are in a livestreaming generation and most cities are going this way and as we move forward, there are a billion people on Facebook. In a digital context, www.YouTube.com is a good thing but it is a destination and Facebook is where people are nowadays. Nikki Lloyd said we made steps forward to be on www.YouTube.com and our meetings are available at any time. If someone is available to watch meetings, she would prefer them in person rather than by Livestreaming to address their questions or comments. Nikki Lloyd said her fear with livestreaming is the creation of an online space for debate when comments may be put out for everyone and not everyone can make decisions for the city. It would be better to receive these comments via email or in person. There is a lot of back and forth commenting which may create some potential hostility. Greg Lockhart said with Facebook live, the comment section can be taken out. It will be displayed in the most common place people are online. We can limit debate, or have no debate. Nikki Lloyd said we could also post and make available the video on the city's home page. Wes Poole said he is having trouble understanding the concept of not wanting more people to see this and does not see any downside to it. Being opposed to allowing a community of 25,000 people to view meetings in this fashion does not make sense. It seems we are going out of our way to limit peoples' accessibility to what we are doing. Nikki Lloyd said she is not opposed to this, but does not know that she has a firm opinion about it. Greg Lockhart said people use social media to communicate in a digital way and everyone in this room probably has a smart phone and the city has several Facebook pages and this will tether us to the people.

Roll call on the motion: Yeas: Dick Brady, Greg Lockhart and Wes Poole, 3. Nays: Naomi Twine, Dennis Murray, Nikki Lloyd and Dave Waddington, 4. The President declared the motion failed.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Dave Waddington, the commission voted to schedule a Public Hearing for the CDBG Annual Action Plan at the April 10 Commission meeting. The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Nikki Lloyd, the commission voted to provide a \$1,000 one-time bonus in pay to Paige Doster in the Law Department.

Discussion: Dennis Murray said the Administrative Benefits Review Committee provided a recommendation to the Audit/Finance Committee to provide a \$1,000 bonus to Paige Doster in the Law Department for the extraordinary work done while performing her normal job duties and filling in for the Commission Clerk during Kelly Kresser's absence. The members of the Audit/Finance Committee unanimously approved this.

The President declared the motion passed.

Upon motion of Nikki Lloyd and second of Naomi Twine, the commission voted to direct the City Manager to look into re-creating the Sandusky Youth Commission. The President declared the motion passed.

AUDIENCE PARTICIPATION

Sharon Johnson, 1139 Fifth Street, said she is currently a member of the Revolving Loan Fund Committee and asked if she is being fired. Dennis Murray said a new committee is being created and all who previously served on two separate committees would be invited to apply to sit on the joint committee. It is anticipated there will be room for everyone who served before.

Upon motion of Dave Waddington and second of Wes Poole, the commission voted to adjourn at 8:25 p.m. The President declared the motion passed.

Kelly L. Kresser, CMC
Commission Clerk

Dennis E. Murray, Jr.
President of the City Commission